#### **APPROVED**

# MINUTES OF THE ALAMEDA COUNTY WASTE MANAGEMENT AUTHORITY MEETING OF THE PROGRAMS AND ADMINISTRATION COMMITTEE

Thursday, January 11, 2018

9:00 A.M.

StopWaste Offices 1537 Webster Street Oakland, CA 94612 510-891-6500

#### **Members Present:**

Castro Valley Sanitary District **Dave Sadoff** City of Dublin Don Biddle City of Fremont Vinnie Bacon City of Hayward Sara Lamnin City of Livermore **Bob Carling** City of Newark Mike Hannon City of Oakland Dan Kalb Oro Loma Sanitary District Shelia Young City of San Leandro Deborah Cox City of Union City Lorrin Ellis

## Absent:

County of Alameda Keith Carson
City of Berkeley Jesse Arreguin

#### **Staff Present:**

Wendy Sommer, Executive Director
Pat Cabrera, Administrative Services Director
Tom Padia, Deputy Executive Director
Meri Soll, Senior Program Manager
Justin Lehrer, Senior Program Manager
Arliss Dunn, Clerk of the Board

## **Others Present:**

Peter Deibler, HF&H Consultants

# 1. Convene Meeting

Chair Dave Sadoff called the meeting to order at 9:01 a.m.

## 2. Public Comments

There were none.

#### **APPROVED**

# 3. Approval of the Draft Minutes of December 14, 2017 (Pat Cabrera)

Board member Lamnin made the motion to approve the draft minutes of December 14, 2017. Board member Ellis seconded and the motion carried 9-0 (Ayes: Bacon, Biddle, Carling, Cox, Ellis, Hannon, Lamnin, Sadoff, Young. Nays: None. Abstain: None. Absent: Arreguin, Carson, Kalb).

# 4. Five Year Program Review (Meri Soll)

This item is for information only.

Tom Padia provided an overview of the staff report and introduced Peter Deibler, HF&H Consultants. Mr. Deibler presented a PowerPoint presentation and provided an overview of the key findings of their research. A link to the staff report and the presentation is available here: <a href="Five-Year-Review-01-11-18.pdf">Five-Year-Review-01-11-18.pdf</a>

Board member Cox inquired about the large drop indicated on slide #2 of the presentation and the issue of market volatility. Mr. Deibler stated that that the large drop occurred in 2008/2009 and was attributed to the great recession and refers to revenue per ton not volume of materials. Mr. Padia recalled the huge crash at the end of 2008 when the agency introduced the Plant Debris Ban Ordinance which would have included plant debris and corrugated cardboard. The prices for corrugated cardboard dropped significantly for a couple of months, below the cost of baling and shipping the material, but rebounded thereafter. Board member Hannon inquired about slide #13 of the presentation and the issue of C&D being diverted to other locales and inquired if there is concern that the respective jurisdictions are not given credit for the diversion. Mr. Padia replied that there is no concern regarding having the materials leave the jurisdiction, but rather where the materials end up. Mr. Padia added the impact of C&D on the diversion rate is a function of each jurisdiction's enforcement of their ordinance and of the state building code which requires anyone applying for a construction permit to submit a debris management plan and a final summary with weight tags outlining where the materials ended up. Some cities are more diligent than others with respect to the final tags. Board member Hannon stated that some cities require the developer to put down a deposit in terms of the amount of C&D materials that they anticipate to generate and the deposit is refundable upon completion of the project. Board member Hannon inquired if any of the cities in Alameda County have such a process. Mr. Padia stated that at one time Dublin had such a process for large projects but is unsure if any of the cities currently have such a process. Mr. Deibler stated that San Jose has a deposit system but is looking at modifying the process. He added the amount of C&D is extremely volatile and dependent upon remodeling and new construction. Ms. Soll stated that with respect to the deposit system the deposits are so minimal in comparison to the cost of building that many times the contractors may not care that deposits are not returned, so in terms of revenue the deposits are not an impetus to implement and procure the proper C&D recycling activities. Board member Hannon suggested that it may be something that the Board may want to revisit in the future and consider implementing countywide because the C&D tonnage is significant and San Jose has been quite successful in ensuring that the C&D tonnage is properly disposed of as well as a source of revenue.

Chair Sadoff referenced page ES-I in the Executive Summary with respect to the National Sword and the contamination rate and inquired if the rate is 0.3 percent or 1 percent. Mr. Deibler stated that it began at 0.3 percent which is very minimal and increased to 0.5 percent most recently, as China's policy is in flux. Chair Sadoff inquired about the qualification requirements for third-party evaluators and asked if there is an oversight process. Mr. Deibler stated an oversight process needs to be developed that is rigorous and transparent. Ms. Soll added she is familiar with mixed C&D facility or third-party certification but there is no over-arching third-party certification venue for across the board materials. Chair Sadoff referenced page ES-7 of the Executive Summary with respect to recyclables in the garbage and noted that Castro Valley, Hayward, Oro Loma and San Leandro appear as outliers and inquired about an explanation for this. Mr. Deibler stated that he is unsure as to why it occurred and it could be the timing of the sampling. He added

#### **APPROVED**

there would be concern if it were a consistent pattern over a period of years. Mr. Deibler stated that the key point of the chart illustrates that if you removed the residential carts that have no "good stuff" in the garbage, the carts that remain consistent have relatively minimal recyclables in the carts. Chair Sadoff thanked Mr. Deibler for his presentation and requested that staff email a copy of the PowerPoint to the committee.

# 5. Packaging Update (Justin Lehrer)

This item is for information only.

Justin Lehrer provided an overview of the staff report and presented a PowerPoint presentation. A link to the report and the presentation is available here: <a href="Packaging-Update-01-11-18.pdf">Packaging-Update-01-11-18.pdf</a>

Board member Lamnin inquired if there are conversations with moving companies regarding the use of cling wrap for packaging. Mr. Lehrer stated yes, and when we moved into our current building we utilized reusable moving crates with minimal cardboard waste and no plastic film waste. This is more common on the commercial side of moving, however there is a company called Frogbox that targets residential moving but there is a need for growth in this area. Board member Lamnin suggested utilizing tabling events to inform the business sector about our grant programs as well as utilizing social media as we do with the food waste tips. Mr. Lehrer stated that the technical assistance team is pounding the pavement and reaching out to businesses. Mr. Lehrer added the focus this year is on food manufacturing businesses. Board member Lamnin asked if the low recycling rate for plastic pouches is attributed to them not being recyclable or is it that the public is not aware. Mr. Lehrer replied that the plastic pouches are composite, or multi-layered and it is technically difficult to separate the layers for recycling. Dow Chemical produces a lot of this type of packaging and is involved in the work to develop more recyclable options. Mr. Lehrer added there is the front end of designing packaging that should be recyclable, and the back end of ensuring that the packaging will be compatible with existing sorting equipment. Board member Lamnin inquired about the need for plastic or cardboard packaging when utilizing Amazon lockers. Mr. Lehrer stated he is encouraged with his contact at Amazon as he understands the issues and is receptive. If he is effective in convincing the Amazon's decision makers, they could pursue a variety of approaches to increase recycling of their packaging.

Board member Cox commented that there is a paradox with the plastic bags that keep food fresh longer with respect to food waste and the issue of recyclability of the plastic bags and Assembly member Quirk's office is working with a company in Union City on this issue. Board member Hannon commented that anything that staff could do to increase public awareness about which items are recyclable would be helpful as well as consistency countywide on recyclability of items. Board member Hannon requested that staff come back to the Board and inform about where we differ in the county on recyclable materials. Mr. Lehrer stated that one key example is poly coated papers such as milk cartons where there is significant inconsistency and a moving target as to what is the best course of action for this packaging. Board member Cox commented with respect to Amazon that maybe there can be a twofold discussion regarding package theft and utilizing the Amazon lockers. Chair Sadoff thanked Mr. Lehrer for a great presentation.

#### 6. Member Comments

Board member Young announced that Frank Sidari, former Oro Loma Board member, passed away and requested to adjourn the meeting in his memory.

#### 7. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 10:15 a.m. in memory of Frank Sidari.