

APPROVED

**MINUTES OF THE ALAMEDA COUNTY WASTE
MANAGEMENT AUTHORITY MEETING
OF THE
PROGRAMS AND ADMINISTRATION COMMITTEE**

Thursday, February 11, 2016

9:00 A.M.

**StopWaste Offices
1537 Webster Street
Oakland CA 94612
510-891-6500**

Members Present:

City of Alameda	Jim Oddie
City of Berkeley	Susan Wengraf
Castro Valley Sanitary District	Dave Sadoff
City of Dublin	Don Biddle
City of Fremont	Suzanne Lee Chan
City of Newark	Mike Hannon
City of Oakland	Dan Kalb
Oro Loma Sanitary District	Shelia Young
City of San Leandro	Deborah Cox
City of Union City	Lorrin Ellis

Absent:

County of Alameda	Keith Carson
City of Livermore	Laureen Turner

Staff Present:

Wendy Sommer, Executive Director
Tom Padia, Deputy Executive Director
Judi Ettliger, Senior Program Manager
Patricia Cabrera, Administrative Services Director
Gina Peters, Chief Financial Officer
Justin Lehrer, Senior Program Manager
Debra Kaufman, Senior Program Manager
Arliss Dunn, Clerk of the Board

1. Convene Meeting

Chair Dave Sadoff called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m.

2. Public Comments

There were none.

3. Approval of the Draft Minutes of January 14, 2016 (Wendy Sommer)

Action

Board member Biddle made the motion to approve the draft minutes of January 14, 2016. Board member Hannon seconded and the motion was carried 7-0 (Carson, Ellis, Kalb, Turner and Young absent).

APPROVED

4. Community Murals (Judi Ettlinger)

Information

This item is for information only.

Judi Ettlinger provided an overview of the project and presented an online “flipbook” of the murals. A link to the presentation is available here: [Murals-02-11-16](#)

Board member Chan inquired if StopWaste name is included on the murals. Ms. Ettlinger affirmed that StopWaste name is included on the murals. Board member Sadoff inquired if the grants are allocated per mural project. Ms. Ettlinger stated that initially the Melrose Academy grant in the amount of \$5,000 was an individual project through our community grants program. Subsequent to that project, staff collaborated with the Community Rejuvenation Project and awarded them \$30,000 to do additional murals through the grants to non-profits program. The money went to the artists. Board member Hannon commended staff on an excellent choice for grant funding as it beautifies the area. Board member Chan inquired if there are plans for more murals. Ms. Ettlinger stated staff is proposing to allocate an additional \$20,000 towards the program and invited Board members to provide information about their city’s interest in the mural project.

Chair Sadoff thanked Ms. Ettlinger for the presentation.

5. Annual Audit for Fiscal Year 2014/15 (Pat Cabrera & Gina Peters)

Action

Staff recommends that the P&A and the P&O Committees review and forward the audit report to the Waste Management Authority and Energy Council for acceptance and filing, and that the Recycling Board accept and file the audit report.

Gina Peters provided an overview of the staff report. The report is available here: [Audit Report-02-11-16](#)

Katherine Yuen, Maze & Associates, stated that the audit received an unmodified opinion and there were no internal deficiencies.

Board member Chan inquired about the recent payment approved by the Board towards the unfunded liability (UL). Ms. Cabrera stated the agency made a \$600,000 payment; however, the UL amount is a moving target. Staff will provide an update on our current position at the February 17 WMA meeting as well as staff recommendations on setting a funding percentage target for the UL. Ms. Yuen added that as of June 30, 2014 the OPEB (Other Post Employment Benefits) assets for the Agency were over \$2.2 million (and no unfunded liability).

Board member Oddie made the motion to forward the audit report to the Waste Management Authority and the Energy Council for acceptance and filing. Board member Chan seconded and the motion carried 10-0 (Carson and Turner absent).

6. Assessment Criteria for Product Decisions Activities (Justin Lehrer)

Action

Staff recommends that the Board review and approve the proposed criteria for evaluating targets and programs.

Justin Lehrer provided an overview of the staff report and presented a PowerPoint presentation. The combined report and presentation is available here: [PD Criteria-02-11-16](#)

Board member Hannon stated that it would be helpful to have a side-by-side view of the current measurements and the proposed criteria and to evaluate any possible environmental or economic impacts toward local businesses. Mr. Lehrer stated that the targets were developed as aspirational goals. Board member Ellis inquired if the criteria are intended as an internal tool. Mr. Lehrer stated yes and there’s potential to apply the criteria to other work that we are doing such as the grants we fund as well as the potential use of the organics processing development (OPD) reserve funds. Board member Ellis added it is a great starting point and commended staff for formalizing a process for evaluating projects. He added it

APPROVED

would be helpful to establish a numeric or value statement for measuring specific projects as appropriate. Mr. Lehrer stated that the criteria initially included a yes/no weighted scoring system and will continue to explore incorporating scoring criteria. Board member Chan recommended adding an additional criteria "Additional Information" where other influences may be considered but not included in the standing criteria. She added the City of Fremont staff that attended TAC stated their approval for the process. Board member Chan inquired if staff can do a mock project using the proposed criteria and Board member Ellis suggested doing sample yes/no projects using the criteria.

Board member Sadoff inquired as to what would determine a fatal flaw in a project that would signal elimination of a project. Mr. Lehrer stated that staff would definitely want to determine the fatal flaw early enough in the project phase and there are current projects where we know that we have reached a plateau or there are diminishing returns and staff will recommend a different approach or recommend sunseting the project. Board member Biddle stated his support for the project evaluation as it is important to determine how it fits with our mission and evaluating the projects effectiveness.

Board member Ellis made the motion to approve the staff recommendation. Board member Biddle seconded and the motion carried 10-0 (Carson and Turner absent).

- | | |
|---|---------------|
| 7. Organics Processing Development Reserve Usage & Criteria (Debra Kaufman) | Action |
| Staff recommends that the Committee direct staff to budget OPD Reserve funds for organics diversion projects that go beyond in-county processing capacity, using the proposed product decisions criteria. | |

Debra Kaufman provided an overview of the staff report. The report is available here: [OPD Memo-02-11-16](#)

Board member Wengraf inquired about the timeline for the EBMUD facility. Ms. Kaufman stated that EBMUD is currently in the permitting phase and is expected to appear before the Board for a COIWMP amendment sometime in the next 3-6 months. Mr. Padia added the current agreement indicates a start date of July 1, 2016 however recent information indicates possibly the end of 2017. Board member Wengraf inquired if we have any programs that target the source i.e. farmers and not only the end users i.e. the residents. Ms. Kaufman stated that we mainly focus on Alameda County generators and we work at the State level on policy for best practices around agriculture and best uses for compost. Brian Mathews stated that most waste from farms do not end up in the landfill as they are tilled back to the soil and large distributors such as Safeway have a backhaul program. They backhaul bruised and spoiled food from stores to their distribution centers and then transport it to a composting facility. The food scraps that we see in the Waste Characterization Study are from restaurants, plate scrapings, etc. Ms. Sommer added we are working on the upcycle stream by working with food banks and other food producers to reduce the amount of food waste generated.

Board member Chan inquired if there is opportunity for some of the reserve funds to be allocated to member agencies to augment their organics programs. Mr. Padia stated we are currently doing a pilot project in Fremont to try and increase single family residential organics and the \$125,000 for the project is from the organics reserve. We will not have information from the pilot study until possibly in June. The Less Than Weekly pilot in Castro Valley is also funded from the OPD reserve. Both pilots are aimed at identifying "best practices" that member agencies could incorporate into their ongoing organics diversion programs.

Board member Cox stated that there are many residents in San Leandro with fruit trees and inquired about Urban Gleaning. Ms. Kaufman stated that the agency lobbyist worked on a bill this year with the LEAs (Local Enforcement Agencies) to make it easier for individuals to glean and then sell the materials to farmers markets and other places. Board member Sadoff stated that in Castro Valley the Girl Scouts gleaned neighborhood trees and donated the fruit to the Food Bank.

APPROVED

Board member Kalb inquired about EBMUD's response to staff when informed that they were not going to receive the \$1 million. Ms. Kaufman stated that they understood that they could not meet our criteria but welcomed the funding towards cleaning up the organics designated for the facility or some other supportive use. Ms. Sommer added there have been numerous meetings with the General Manager and Project Manager over the past 8 years asking them about alternative projects or other proposals and they have not responded to us.

Board member Wengraf made the motion to approve the staff recommendation. Board member Young made a friendly amendment to the motion to combine the \$1 million EBMUD reserve with the OPD Reserve funds for organics diversion projects that go beyond in-county processing capacity, using the proposed product decisions criteria. Board member Cox seconded and the motion carried 10-0 (Carson and Turner absent).

8. Member Comments

Ms. Sommer inquired if Board members had received the Closed Session materials via hard copy mail. They were mailed on Tuesday. Board Clerk Arliss Dunn asked Board members to inform her if they do not receive the materials. Ms. Sommer reminded the Board that the WMA meeting this month is on the 3rd Wednesday, February 17.

9. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 10:20 a.m.