AGENDA

MEETING OF THE
PLANNING COMMITTEE
AND
ALAMEDA COUNTY RECYCLING BOARD

Thursday, December 8, 2022
6:00 P.M.

TELECONFERENCE MEETING

Teleconference/Public Participation Information to Mitigate the Spread of COVID-19:

This meeting will be held entirely by teleconference. All Board members, staff, and the public will only participate via the Zoom platform using the process described below. The meeting is being conducted in compliance with the Brown Act, which was amended by AB 361, suspending certain teleconference rules due to the ongoing state of emergency and state and local health officials recommendations to maintain social distancing. The purpose of these amendments was to provide the safest environment for the public, elected officials, and staff while allowing for continued operation of the government and public participation during the COVID-19 pandemic.

Members of the public may attend and participate in the meeting by:

1. Calling US: +1 669 900 6833 and using the webinar id 853 6561 8296
2. Using the Zoom website or App and entering meeting code 853 6561 8296

Board members and any other individuals scheduled to speak at the meeting will be sent a unique link via email to access the meeting as a panelist. All Board members MUST use their unique link to attend the meeting. During the meeting the chair will explain the process for members of the public to be recognized to offer public comment. Public comment is generally limited to three minutes per person for each agenda item. The process will be described on the StopWaste website at http://www.stopwaste.org/virtual-meetings no later than noon Thursday, December 8, 2022. The public may also comment by sending an e-mail to publiccomment@stopwaste.org. Written public comment will be accepted until 3:00 p.m. on the day prior to the scheduled meeting. Copies of all written comments submitted by the deadline above will be provided to each Board Member and will be added to the official record. Comments will not be read into the record.

In accordance with the Americans with Disabilities Act and Brown Act, if you need assistance to participate in this meeting due to a disability, please contact the Clerk of the Board at (510) 891-6517. Notification 24 hours prior to the meeting will enable the agency to make reasonable arrangements to ensure accessibility to this meeting.

Planning Committee/Recycling Board Members

Francisco Zermeño, President
ACWMA

Laura McKaughan, 1st Vice President
Recycling Materials Processing Industry

Dan Kalb, 2nd Vice President
ACWMA

Bob Carling, ACWMA
Eric Havel, Environmental Educator
Darby Hoover, Environmental Organization
Chiman Lee, Recycling Programs
Grace Liao, Source Reduction Specialist
Jaime Patiño, ACWMA
Talia Wise, Solid Waste Industry Representative
Vacant, ACWMA

Timothy Burroughs, Executive Director
I. CALL TO ORDER

II. ROLL CALL OF ATTENDANCE

III. ANNOUNCEMENTS BY PRESIDENT

IV. OPEN PUBLIC COMMENT
    An opportunity is provided for any member of the public wishing to speak on any matter within the jurisdiction of the Board, but not listed on the agenda. Each speaker is limited to three minutes.

V. CONSENT CALENDAR
   1. Approval of the Draft Joint WMA, EC, and PC & RB Minutes of November 16, 2022
   2. Resolution regarding meeting via teleconference to promote social distancing, pursuant to AB 361
      Adopt Resolution #RB 2022-14.
   3. Board Attendance Record
   4. Written Report of Ex Parte Communications

VI. REGULAR CALENDAR
   1. Expenditure Plan Approvals and Updates for Accumulated Measure D Funds (Meri Soll & Jennifer West)
      Staff recommends that the Recycling Board approve the Expenditure Plans submitted by the Cities of Berkeley and Newark and receive and approve the Expenditure Plan updates by Albany, Dublin and Pleasanton.
   2. Rules of Procedure for Teleconferencing at Recycling Board Meetings (Timothy Burroughs)
      Staff recommends that the Recycling Board adopt Resolution 2022-15 to remove the limit on the number of Board Members who may utilize teleconferencing for Board and Committee meetings and to incorporate the Just Cause and Personal Emergency provisions of AB 2449.
   3. 2023 Meeting Schedule (Timothy Burroughs)
      That the Planning Committee and Recycling Board approve the 2023 meeting schedule.
   4. Election of Officers for 2023 (Timothy Burroughs)
      That the Planning Committee and Recycling Board elect Officers for 2023.

VII. MEMBER COMMENTS AND COMMUNICATIONS FROM THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

VIII. ADJOURNMENT – to January 12, 2023 at 4:00 p.m.
MINUTES OF THE JOINT MEETING OF THE
ALAMEDA COUNTY WASTE MANAGEMENT AUTHORITY (WMA) BOARD,
THE
ENERGY COUNCIL (EC),
AND
PLANNING COMMITTEE AND RECYCLING BOARD

Wednesday, November 16, 2022
3:00 P.M.

TELECONFERENCE MEETING

I. CALL TO ORDER
President Martinez called the meeting to order at 3:00 p.m. Timothy Burroughs explained the process that would be utilized during the meeting. A link to the process is available here: Virtual-Meetings-Instructions

II. ROLL CALL OF ATTENDANCE

WMA, EC & RB
City of Alameda Trish Herrera Spencer, WMA, EC
City of Albany Preston Jordan, WMA, EC
City of Berkeley Susan Wengraf, WMA, EC
Castro Valley Sanitary District Dave Sadoff, WMA, RB
City of Dublin Melissa Hernandez, WMA, EC
City of Emeryville Dianne Martinez, WMA, EC (President)
City of Hayward Francisco Zermeño, WMA, EC, RB (RB President)
City of Livermore Bob Carling, WMA, EC, RB
City of Oakland Dan Kalb, WMA, EC, RB
Oro Loma Sanitary District Shelia Young, WMA
City of Piedmont Jen Cavenaugh, WMA, EC
City of Pleasanton Jack Balch, WMA, EC (EC President)
City of San Leandro Deborah Cox, WMA, EC, RB
Environmental Educator Eric Havel, RB
Environmental Organization Darby Hoover, RB
Recycling Programs Chiman Lee, RB
Solid Waste Industry Representative Talia Wise, RB
Source Reduction Specialist Grace Liao, RB

Absent
County of Alameda David Haubert, WMA, EC
City of Fremont Jenny Kassan, WMA, EC
City of Newark Mike Hannon, WMA, EC
City of Union City Jaime Patiño, WMA, EC
Recycling Materials Processing Industry Laura McKaughan, RB

Staff Participating
Timothy Burroughs, Executive Director
Pat Cabrera, Administrative Services Director
Alma Freeman, Communications Manager
Justin Lehrer, Operations Manager
Rachel Balsley, Senior Program Manager
III. ANNOUNCEMENTS BY PRESIDENTS
There were none.

IV. OPEN PUBLIC DISCUSSION FROM THE FLOOR
There were no public comments on the remote call and no public comments were received via the public comments email portal.

V. CONSENT CALENDAR
1. Approval of the Draft WMA & EC Minutes of October 26, 2022
2. Resolution regarding meeting via teleconference to promote social distancing, pursuant to AB 361
   Adopt Resolution WMA# 2022-15.
3. Resolution regarding meeting via teleconference to promote social distancing, pursuant to AB 361
4. Approval of the Draft PC & RB Minutes of October 13, 2022
5. Recycling Board Attendance Record
6. Written Report of Ex Parte Communications
7. Resolution regarding meeting via teleconference to promote social distancing, pursuant to AB 361
   Adopt Resolution RB# 2022-13.

There were no public comments for the Consent Calendar. Board member Cox moved approval of Items 1-3 of the Consent Calendar for the WMA & EC and Board member Carling seconded. The motion carried 15-0 (WMA) and 14-0 (EC): The Clerk called the roll: (Ayes: Balch, Carling, Cavenaugh, Cox, Hernandez, Jordan, Kalb, Martinez, Sadoff, Spencer, Wengraf, Young, Zermeño. Nays: None. Abstained: None. Absent: Hannon, Haubert, Kassan, Patiño)

Board member Lee moved approval of Items 4-7 of the Consent Calendar for the Recycling Board and Board member Havel seconded. The motion carried 10-0. The Clerk called the roll: (Ayes: Carling, Cox, Havel, Hoover, Kalb, Lee, Liao Sadoff, Wise, Zermeño. Nays: None. Abstained: None. Absent: McKaughan)

VI. REGULAR CALENDAR
1. SB 1383/ORRO Implementation Update (Rachel Balsley, Cassie Bartholomew & Kelly Schoonmaker)
   This item is for information only.
   Timothy Burroughs introduced the item and provided a summary of the staff report. Rachel Balsley, Cassie Bartholomew, and Kelly Schoonmaker provided a PowerPoint presentation to update the Board on how StopWaste is supporting member agencies with various implementation activities of the Organics Reduction and Recycling Ordinance (ORRO), including compliance monitoring/enforcement, reporting to CalRecycle, outreach and education, edible food recovery, recycled organics product
procurement, and more. A link to the staff report and the presentation is available here: SB1383-ORRO-Presentation.pdf. Additional time was provided to the Board for discussion and for clarifying questions. An audio link to the discussion is available here: SB1383-ORRO-Discussion. There were no public comments on this item. President Martinez thanked staff for a very informative presentation.

2. Waste Prevention Grants Program Update (Meri Soll & Cassie Bartholomew)
   This item is for information only.

   Timothy Burroughs introduced the item and provided a summary of the staff report. Meri Soll and Cassie Bartholomew gave a PowerPoint presentation that provided an overview of the upstream grants program. A link to the staff report and the presentation is available here Upstream-Grants-Presentation.pdf

   Additional time was provided to the Board for discussion and clarifying questions. An audio link to the discussion is available here: Upstream-Grants-Discussion

   There were no public comments on this item. The Board thanked Ms. Soll and Ms. Bartholomew for a very informative and inspiring presentation.

3. Appointments to fill upcoming vacancies on the Recycling Board (Timothy Burroughs)
   Staff recommends that the WMA Board fill two vacancies on the Recycling Board by January 25, 2023.

   Timothy Burroughs provided an overview of the staff report. A link to the staff report is available here: RB-Vacancies.pdf. Mr. Burroughs thanked Board members Cox and Sadoff for their service on the Recycling Board.

   President Martinez informed the Board that Board member Patiño indicated a willingness to serve as a WMA appointee to the Recycling Board. Board member Jordan moved to nominate Board member Patiño, in his absence, as a WMA appointee and Board member Cavenaugh seconded the nomination. There were no further nominations and the motion carried 15-0. The Clerk called the roll:


   Board members elected to fill one of the two vacancies at the current meeting and defer the remaining vacancy to the January 2023 meeting. Board member Zermeño moved to defer the remaining vacancy to the January 2023 meeting and Board member Young seconded. The motion carried 15-0. The Clerk called the roll:


   There were no public comments on this item.

4. Interim appointment(s) to the Recycling Board for WMA appointee unable to attend future Board Meeting(s) (Arliss Dunn) (WMA only)
   (The meeting of the Planning Committee & Recycling Board will be held on Thursday, December 8, 2022 at 6:00 p.m. The meeting will be held via teleconference)

   There were no requests for an interim appointment.

VII. MEMBER COMMENTS AND COMMUNICATIONS FROM THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
Vice President Carling read a proclamation presented to President Martinez on behalf of her final meeting as a StopWaste Board member. Board members acknowledged President Martinez, thanked her for her service and remarked on the excellent manner of which she conducted board meetings as President. The agency presented her with a recycled picture frame, water bottle, and reusable tote bag. President Martinez provided remarks on her tenure as a Board member and
thanked the members for their support.

Mr. Burroughs announced that the monthly topic brief highlights holiday sustainability tips. The topic brief is available [here](#).

Mr. Burroughs extended thanks and appreciation to President Martinez for her service.

**VIII. ADJOURNMENT – to WMA & EC MEETING DECEMBER 14, 2022 at 3:00 P.M.**
The meeting adjourned 4:45 p.m.
DATE: December 8, 2022
TO: Recycling Board
FROM: Timothy Burroughs, Executive Director
SUBJECT: Resolution regarding meeting via teleconference to promote social distancing, pursuant to AB 361

SUMMARY
On September 16, 2021, the Governor signed into law as an urgency measure, AB 361 (Rivas), which allows local legislative bodies to continue to meet by teleconference in order to promote public health and safety, subject to certain conditions, which must be reconsidered every 30 days. At its December 8, 2022, meeting, the Recycling Board will consider a resolution to approve and direct the continued use of teleconferencing for its public meetings to enable social distancing, as long as the findings required by AB 361 are met and other provisions of the Brown Act are followed.

DISCUSSION
In light of the continued state of emergency declared by the Governor related to COVID-19, state and local officials have imposed or recommended measures to promote social distancing. This direction from state and local health officials is based on the increased safety protection that social distancing provides as one method to reduce the risk of COVID-19 transmission.

The state of emergency and associated direction from state and local health officials to promote social distancing continues to impact the ability for the Recycling Board to meet safely in person. The direction from public health officials that informs the findings in the attached resolution has not changed. Therefore, staff recommends that the Recycling Board approve the attached resolution to direct the continued use of teleconferencing for its public meetings to enable social distancing, as long as the findings required by AB 361 are met and other provisions of the Brown Act are followed. The Recycling Board will need to revisit the need to conduct meetings remotely at least every 30 days following adoption of the attached resolution.

RECOMMENDATION
Adopt resolution #RB 2022-14.

Attachment: Alameda County Recycling Board Resolution #RB 2022-14
ALAMEDA COUNTY RECYCLING BOARD
RESOLUTION #RB 2022-14

MOVED:
SECONDED:

AT THE MEETING HELD DECEMBER 8, 2022

WHEREAS, in response to the COVID-19 pandemic, the Governor adopted a series of Executive Orders allowing the legislative bodies of local governments to meet remotely via teleconference so long as other provisions of the Brown Act were followed; and

WHEREAS, on September 16, 2021, the Governor signed into law as an urgency measure, AB 361, which allows for the continued use of remote meetings by local legislative bodies subject to certain conditions, which must be reconsidered every 30 days; and

WHEREAS, the Recycling Board has considered the current state of health guidance related to public meetings in Alameda County and finds it necessary to continue with remote meetings to promote public health and safety.

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, that the Recycling Board approves and directs the continued use of teleconferencing for its public meetings based on the following findings required by Government Code Section 54953(e), as amended by AB 361:

- The entire State of California remains under a proclaimed state of emergency as declared by the Governor of the State of California related to the COVID-19 pandemic.
- State and local officials have imposed or recommended measures to promote social distancing. For example, on September 23 the Alameda County Health Care Services Agency Director recommended social distancing at all meetings of the Board of Supervisors and its committees. This recommendation is consistent with the Division of Occupational Safety and Health of California’s (Cal/OSHA) Emergency Temporary Standards, which require employers to train and instruct employees that the use of social distancing helps combat the spread of COVID-19 (8 Cal. Code Regs. 3205(c)(5)(D)).
- The state of emergency continues to directly impact the ability to meet safely in person. For example, given the constraints of the Recycling Board’s available meeting spaces, social distancing is difficult without severely limiting space for members of the public to attend.
- The Board anticipates this resolution will appear on its consent calendar for review and ratification or update at each regular Board meeting for as long as the Governor’s proclaimed state of emergency related to the COVID-19 pandemic remains in effect and the Board desires to continue remote public meetings.
BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that:

1. Recycling Board meetings will continue to be conducted remotely for the next 30 days in compliance with AB 361, to better ensure the health and safety of the public.

2. The Recycling Board will reconsider the circumstances of the state of emergency and the need to conduct meetings remotely at least every 30 days following adoption of this resolution.

3. If the Board determines the need still exists at each 30-day mark, the determination will be ratified by a vote of the Board documented in the minutes of that meeting.

Passed and adopted this 8th day of December 2022 by the following vote:

AYES:
NOES:
ABTAIN:
ABSENT:

____________________________
Arliss Dunn, Clerk of the Board
This page intentionally left blank
### 2022 - ALAMEDA COUNTY RECYCLING BOARD ATTENDANCE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>J</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>M</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>M</th>
<th>J</th>
<th>J</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>S</th>
<th>O</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>D</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>REGULAR MEMBERS</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Carling</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Cox</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Havel</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Hoover</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Lee</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Kalb</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G. Liao</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L. McKaughan</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Sadoff</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T. Wise</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. Zermeño</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M. Zimbalist</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>INTERIM APPOINTEES</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S. Young</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P. Jordan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M. Hannon</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Measure D: Subsection 64.130, F: Recycling Board members shall attend at least three fourths (3/4) of the regular meetings within a given calendar year. At such time, as a member has been absent from more than one fourth (1/4) of the regular meetings in a calendar year, or from two (2) consecutive such meetings, her or his seat on the Recycling Board shall be considered vacant.

X=Attended       A=Absent       I=Absent - Interim Appointed
DATE: December 8, 2022
TO: Recycling Board
FROM: Timothy Burroughs, Executive Director
SUBJECT: Written Reports of Ex Parte Communications

BACKGROUND

Section 64.130 (Q)(1)(b) of the Alameda County Charter requires that full written disclosure of ex parte communications be entered in the Recycling Board's official record. At the June 19, 1991 meeting of the Recycling Board, the Board approved the recommendation of Legal Counsel that such reports be placed on the consent calendar as a way of entering them into the Board's official record. The Board at that time also requested that staff develop a standard form for the reporting of such communications. A standard form for the reporting of ex parte communications has since been developed and distributed to Board members.

At the December 9, 1999 meeting of the Recycling Board, the Board adopted the following language:

Ex parte communication report forms should be submitted only for ex parte communications that are made after the matter has been put on the Recycling Board’s agenda, giving as much public notice as possible.

Per the previously adopted policy, all such reports received will be placed on the consent calendar of the next regularly scheduled Recycling Board meeting.
DATE: December 8, 2022

TO: Recycling Board

FROM: Meri Soll, Senior Program Manager
      Jennifer West, Program Manager

SUBJECT: Expenditure Plan Approvals and Updates for Accumulated Measure D Funds

SUMMARY

The Recycling Board adopted rules for municipal eligibility to receive further disbursements of Measure D revenues once a specified unspent fund balance threshold is exceeded. The municipality must submit, and the Recycling Board must approve, an expenditure plan explaining how the accumulated funds will be spent down below the threshold before the municipality will be eligible to receive further Measure D per-capita monies. The Cities of Berkeley and Newark reported an unspent fund balance at the end of FY 21-22 that exceeds the current policy threshold, and each has submitted an expenditure plan for FY 22-23 and 23-24 for Board consideration. Staff reviewed these plans and recommends Recycling Board approval.

Additionally, the three jurisdictions of Albany, Dublin and Pleasanton submitted expenditure plans for FY 21-23 to the Recycling Board, and will provide an update on those expenditure plans, as required by the resolution adopted in 2021.

DISCUSSION

The County Charter (Measure D) directs that 50% of Recycling Fund revenues generated from the $8.23 per ton landfill surcharge “…shall be disbursed on a per-capita basis to municipalities for the continuation and expansion of municipal recycling programs.” (Subsection 64.060(B)(1)).

In June 2021, the Recycling Board adopted Resolution #RB 2021-02 which revised the 2014 policy containing rules and procedures regarding the accumulation of unspent fund balances, expenditure plans for the use of such accumulated funds, and the eligibility to receive further per-capita disbursements to meet Measure D goals. The purpose of this adopted policy is to encourage the use of Measure D funds to help achieve countywide waste reduction goals, and to discourage accumulating funds without a plan for their use. Specifically, the policy states:

Any municipality receiving per capita disbursements of Recycling Fund monies under the Alameda County Waste Reduction and Recycling Act, Section 64.060, shall present to the Board for its approval a written expenditure plan if, at the end of any fiscal year, that municipality has an unspent balance of such monies that exceeds the amount of $8.00
(eight dollars) multiplied by the population basis used for the first quarterly disbursement of that fiscal year.

Municipality must submit, for the approval of the Recycling Board, an expenditure plan for that municipality to continue to receive future quarterly disbursements. A municipality’s proposed expenditure plan must include the following:

- The scope of work and amount of funds proposed for expenditure to reduce the municipality’s Measure D fund balance to 25% below the allowable threshold of $8.00 (eight dollars) multiplied by the population basis formula
- An expenditure plan and scope of work allocated by fiscal year and designed to expend the required amount within two (2) fiscal years from submittal date of the expenditure plan
- Member agency’s manager (City Manager, General Manager, or equivalent) signature

The cities of Berkeley and Newark have submitted Expenditure Plans (Attachments A and B) for Recycling Board consideration to ensure the plans meet the above policy requirements and are reasonable approaches to draw down fund balances to 25% below the allowable threshold. This is the first expenditure plan for Berkeley and it is mainly due to a large, delayed contract that is expected to be implemented in FY23. This is the fourth expenditure plan for review and approval by the Recycling Board from the City of Newark. Plans were submitted and approved by the Recycling Board for FY 16-18, FY 18-20 as well as for FY 20-22 under the previous Resolution #RB 2014-2. City of Newark staff have shared with StopWaste that they were unable to meet the goals set for their FY 20-22 expenditure plan (approved by the Recycling Board in October 2020) as a result of Measure D activity suspension and hiring delays due to COVID-19 pandemic restrictions, as well as invoices and contract payments made in FY 22-23 instead of in FY 21-22.

The Cities of Albany, Dublin and Pleasanton submitted plans for FY 21-23 that were approved by the Recycling Board in December 2021 and are providing an update on their progress at this time (Attachments C, D and E). Their updates show they are on track to reducing their Measure D fund balances by June 30, 2023.

In 2023, StopWaste expects that municipalities will continue to increase activities related to SB 1383 implementation, including procurement of recycled organic materials, consultant contracts, and additional staff time needed for SB 1383 technical assistance and outreach to the community. These expenses should further reduce Measure D fund balances.

At the December 2022 Board meeting, staff will provide an overview of the attached Expenditure Plans. Representatives from the Cities of Albany, Berkeley, Dublin, Newark and Pleasanton will be available to respond to any questions related to the expenditure plan details.

**RECOMMENDATION**

Staff recommends that the Recycling Board approve the Expenditure Plans submitted by the Cities of Berkeley and Newark and receive and approve the Expenditure Plan updates by Albany, Dublin and Pleasanton.

Attachments:

Attachment A – City of Berkeley FY 22-24 Expenditure Plan
Attachment B – City of Newark FY 22-24 Expenditure Plan
Attachment C – City of Albany FY 21-23 Measure D Expenditure Plan update
Attachment D – City of Dublin FY 21-23 Measure D Expenditure Plan update
Attachment E – City of Pleasanton FY 21-23 Measure D Expenditure Plan update
CITY OF BERKELEY  
MEASURE D EXPENDITURE PLAN for FY 22.23 and FY 23.24  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measure D Jurisdiction Threshold ($8 X population)</th>
<th>$994,568</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fund Balance at end of FY 21.22</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Expenditure Plan required - exceeds allowable threshold)</td>
<td>$1,193,396</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anticipated Fund Balance at end of FY 22.23</td>
<td>$395,831</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Anticipated Fund Balance at end of FY 23.24</strong></td>
<td><strong>$475,831</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maximum fund balance allowed under Resolution</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Resolution requires 25% below allowable threshold)</td>
<td>$745,926</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measure D expenses</th>
<th>FY 22.23 Planned Spending</th>
<th>FY 23.24 Planned Spending</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Outreach &amp; Promotion</td>
<td>$10,000</td>
<td>$10,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organics and Recycling Carts</td>
<td>$95,000</td>
<td>$50,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction &amp; Debris out of County Mitigation Fees</td>
<td>$55,518</td>
<td>$35,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction &amp; Debris Recycling (1)</td>
<td>$1,002,047</td>
<td>$190,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Planned Expenditures:</strong></td>
<td><strong>$1,162,565</strong></td>
<td><strong>$285,000</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(1) C&D contract was renegotiated end of FY 21.22, contract expenditures will be utilized to spend down fund balance.
CITY OF NEWARK

MEASURE D EXPENDITURE PLAN for FY 22.23 and FY 23.24

47,529 population

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measure D Jurisdiction Threshold ($8 X population )</th>
<th>$380,232</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fund Balance at end of FY 21.22</td>
<td>$629,877</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Expenditure Plan required- exceeds allowable threshold)</td>
<td>$316,877</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anticipated Fund Balance at end of FY 22.23</td>
<td>$248,877</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maximum fund balance allowed under Resolution</td>
<td>$285,174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Resolution requires 25% below allowable threshold)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measure D expenses</th>
<th>FY 22.23 Planned Spending</th>
<th>FY 23.24 Planned Spending</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Newark Staff Salary (time spent on Measure D)</td>
<td>$115,000</td>
<td>$124,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Outreach/promotional items/Green Halo</td>
<td>$36,000</td>
<td>$36,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civic Center LEED Certification[1]</td>
<td>$50,000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civic Center ReScape (Bay Friendly) Certifications[2]</td>
<td>$100,000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consultant – Rate study/collection hauler contract services[3]</td>
<td>$63,000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consultant for SB 1383 Planning and Implementation[4]</td>
<td>$99,000</td>
<td>$50,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purchase of compost bins/kitchen pails for residents</td>
<td>$15,000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Green Halo balance due</td>
<td>$12,000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Planned Expenditures:</strong></td>
<td><strong>$490,000</strong></td>
<td><strong>$210,000</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[1] This project has been completed but will be accounted for in FY 22/23.
[2] This project has been completed but will be accounted for in FY 22/23.
[3] Contract has been executed. Total contract amount is $94,000. Two thirds of the expended funds will be charged to Measure D.
[4] Contract has been executed. Funds should be expended by end of FY22/23.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measure D Jurisdiction Threshold ($8 X population)</th>
<th>$162,168</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fund Balance at end of FY 20.21 (Expenditure Plan required - exceeds allowable threshold)</td>
<td>$202,173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fund Balance at end of FY 21.22</td>
<td>$188,910</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anticipated Fund Balance at end of FY 22.23</td>
<td>$96,855</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maximum fund balance allowed under Resolution (Resolution requires 25% below allowable threshold)</td>
<td>$121,626</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measure D expenses</th>
<th>FY 21.22 Planned Spending</th>
<th>FY 21.22 Actual Spending</th>
<th>FY 21.22 Explanation for shortfall in spending</th>
<th>FY 22.23 Planned Spending - Updated</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Staffing Costs</td>
<td>$40,000</td>
<td>$34,350</td>
<td>Actual staffing costs lower than anticipated, to prepare for future costs starting in FY22-23.</td>
<td>Staffing Costs $34,750</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bigbelly Lease FY2021.22, Bigbelly installation (staff time and materials)</td>
<td>$13,000</td>
<td>$0</td>
<td>Big Belly installations delayed, lease not started until FY22-23.</td>
<td>Big Belly Installation ($5,500k) Big Belly lease ($14,000k) $19,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misc. Annual Expenses (City hazardous waste drop-offs, City staff professional development/conferences, physical assets, special events, Green Business Program membership, etc.)</td>
<td>$10,000</td>
<td>$7,836</td>
<td>Spending lower than expected as costs for City facilities and City-collected household hazardous waste were less than budgeted.</td>
<td>Misc. Annual Expenses $7,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SB 1383 Implementation (technical assistance, procurement, outreach)</td>
<td>$45,000</td>
<td>$28,698</td>
<td>Spending lower due to delay in releasing RFQ for SB 1383 consulting services. Contract finalized end of 2022</td>
<td>SB 1383 Implementation (technical assistance, procurement, outreach) $78,427</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total expenditures</strong></td>
<td><strong>$108,000</strong></td>
<td><strong>$70,884</strong></td>
<td><strong>($37,116)</strong></td>
<td><strong>$149,677</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Difference between planned spending and actual</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>See explanations above</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Measure D Jurisdiction Threshold (8X population)
- 72,589 population

### Fund Balance at end of FY 20.21
- Expenditure Plan required - exceeds allowable threshold
- $750,368

### Fund Balance at end of FY 21.22
- $500,495

### Anticipated Fund Balance at end of FY 22.23
- $404,379

### Maximum fund balance allowed under Resolution (Resolution requires 25% below allowable threshold)
- $435,534

#### Measure D expenses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>FY 21.22 Planned Spending</th>
<th>FY 21.22 Actual Spending</th>
<th>FY 21.22 Explanation for shortfall in spending</th>
<th>FY 22.23 Planned Spending - Updated</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Consultant support for SB 1383 related franchise agreement contract amendments and negotiations.</td>
<td>$109,313</td>
<td>$93,690</td>
<td>Contract negotiations are continuing into FY 22-23.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consultant support for SB 1383 implementation assistance.</td>
<td>$89,540</td>
<td>$45,869</td>
<td>Actual expenditures lower than planned, time spent was less with higher level of support provided by others than anticipated.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Green Halo and Recyclist</td>
<td>$36,000</td>
<td>$5,000</td>
<td>Some expenses paid by Building Division. Remaining fees to be charged in FY 22-23.</td>
<td>Recyclist for SB 1383 recordkeeping.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 stream systems /bins/containers/signage</td>
<td>$59,613</td>
<td>$85,608</td>
<td>Actual spending was higher: increased use of city parks and demand for waste/recycling collection.</td>
<td>Three stream containers for parks and public spaces</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CivicSpark Fellow (50%).</td>
<td>$14,500</td>
<td>$13,182</td>
<td></td>
<td>Fellow supports solid waste/recycling programs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>memberships, conferences, travel, mileage.</td>
<td>$3,000</td>
<td>$2,120</td>
<td>Some conferences remained virtual.</td>
<td>Memberships, conferences, travel, mileage.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disaster Debris Management Plan.</td>
<td>$18,899</td>
<td>$18,899</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carbon Sequestration Pilot Project. Cost to procure compost for the project.</td>
<td>$50,000</td>
<td>$0</td>
<td>Delays in carbon farming pilot project. Compost application in FY 22-23</td>
<td>Carbon Sequestration Pilot Project. Cost to procure compost for the project.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recycled content playground and building material for Don Biddle Community Park.</td>
<td>$100,000</td>
<td>$103,167</td>
<td>Expenditures were completed as planned.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reusable items (Foodware, cups and masks)</td>
<td>$9,570</td>
<td>$8,064</td>
<td>Reusable items (Foodware, cups and masks)</td>
<td>Special Events</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alameda County Green Business Program assistance.</td>
<td>$2,000</td>
<td>$500</td>
<td>Spending was less than anticipated.</td>
<td>Alameda Co Green Business Program assistance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EcoHero assemblies for schools to engage students in waste reduction, composting and recycling.</td>
<td>$4,318</td>
<td>$1,968</td>
<td>Partial payment by CalRecycle’s City/County payment program.</td>
<td>EcoHero assemblies for schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other misc spending</td>
<td>$2,312</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental Technician - Staff</td>
<td>$64,235</td>
<td></td>
<td>Environmental Technician - staff</td>
<td>$65,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staff Time for Franchise Agreement Negotiations</td>
<td>$11,772</td>
<td></td>
<td>Fix It Clinic program and technical assistance.</td>
<td>$10,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Measures of expenditure plan for FY 21.22

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Planned</th>
<th>Actual</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$496,753</td>
<td>$456,385</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Difference between planned spending and actual FY 22

- $40,368

See explanations above

### ATTACHMENT D

**Total Expenditures for FY 21.22**

- $496,753

**Total Expenditures FY 22.23 (planned)**

- $302,630
# CITY OF PLEASANTON

## MEASURE D EXPENDITURE PLAN for FY 21.22 and FY 22.23 - UPDATE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measure D Jurisdiction Threshold ($8 X population )</th>
<th>$638,968</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fund Balance at end of FY 20.21</td>
<td>$740,689</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Expenditure Plan required - exceeds allowable threshold)</td>
<td>$638,968</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fund Balance at end of FY 21.22</td>
<td>$565,226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anticipated Fund Balance at end of FY 22.23</td>
<td>$281,701</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maximum fund balance allowed under Resolution</td>
<td>$479,226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Resolution requires 25% below allowable threshold)</td>
<td>$479,226</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measure D expenses</th>
<th>FY 21.22 Planned Spending</th>
<th>FY 21.22 Actual Spending</th>
<th>FY 21.22 Explanation for shortfall in spending</th>
<th>FY 22.23 Planned Spending - Updated</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>60% of a Management Analyst Position</td>
<td>$126,200</td>
<td>$135,876</td>
<td>Consultant Costs -$40,000 due to the timing of the scope of work and expenditures consultant costs were carried over into FY23</td>
<td>60% of a Management Analyst Position $126,200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contracts HF&amp;H – SB 1383 Implementation Project, as needed technical assistance and Recyclist for record-keeping</td>
<td>$200,000</td>
<td>$160,095</td>
<td>Contracts HF&amp;H – SB 1383 Implementation Project, as needed technical assistance and Recyclist for record-keeping</td>
<td>$240,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contract with Go Green Initiative</td>
<td>$50,000</td>
<td>$50,000</td>
<td>Contract with Go Green Initiative $50,000</td>
<td>$50,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misc. Supplies and Equipment</td>
<td>$50,000</td>
<td>$38,656</td>
<td>Waste equipment -$14,031 to purchase 3 stream waste receptacles for new and existing City-owned facilities. FY 22.23 will add organic waste bins to facilities that are reopening for public use after Covid closures</td>
<td>Misc. Supplies and Equipment $64,031</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advertising and Printing</td>
<td>$36,000</td>
<td>$23,542</td>
<td>1383 outreach materials covered by hauler</td>
<td>Advertising and Printing $36,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Planned</th>
<th>Actual</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Total Expenditures for FY 21.22</th>
<th>$462,200</th>
<th>$408,169</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Difference between planned spending and actual FY 22</td>
<td>-$54,031</td>
<td>See explanations above</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>$516,231</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

---

**ATTACHMENT E**
DATE: December 8, 2022

TO: Recycling Board

FROM: Timothy Burroughs, Executive Director

SUBJECT: Rules of Procedure for Teleconferencing at Recycling Board Meetings

SUMMARY
In March 2022, the Recycling Board adopted interim amendments to the Board’s Rules of Procedure to remove the limit on the number of Board Members who may utilize teleconferencing for Board and Committee meetings, consistent with the Brown Act. The Board directed that the interim amendments would be in place until the end of the calendar year, at which time the Board would reevaluate and consider next steps. The purpose of this memo is for the Board to consider retaining the approved amendments moving forward.

In addition, at the same time as affirming the above-mentioned amendments, staff recommends that the Board also consider amendments to the Rules of Procedure to incorporate the provisions of Assembly Bill (AB) 2449, which was signed by the Governor in September 2022 and adds a new limited teleconferencing option for Board members.

DISCUSSION
Amendments to the Rules of Procedure to remove limits on the number of Board Members who may participate remotely – Prior to the interim amendments approved by the Recycling Board in March 2022, the Board’s Rules of Procedure stated that no more than two Board Members may utilize teleconferencing for a Board meeting at no more than two teleconferencing locations.

The December Recycling Board meeting is an opportunity to evaluate the Board’s interim amendments to remove the limit on the number of Board Members who may utilize teleconferencing for Board meetings. Staff recommends that the Board affirm the approved amendments moving forward. As was discussed by the Board in March, it is not standard practice for regional legislative bodies to have rules of procedure that limit the number of Board Members who may participate by teleconference. Further, providing a teleconference option for Board Members creates environmental benefits from reduced vehicle miles travelled, as well as health
benefits. The Board has also demonstrated its ability to efficiently and effectively carry out its work while participating remotely.

Amendments to the Rules of Procedure to incorporate provisions of AB 2449 – The passage of AB 2449 means that there are now three distinct options for Board Members to teleconference for board and committee meetings:

1. “The Usual” option: This option is generally the teleconferencing option that has historically been available; it requires the Board member to post a hard copy of the agenda at their remote location and allow the public to physically attend the meeting at the location where the Board member is located (e.g., Board Member’s home, office, or hotel room). This option does not have a sunset. (See Government Code section 54953(b).)

2. “The Covid Emergency (AB 361)” option: This is the teleconferencing option the legislature adopted in September 2021 (AB 361) in response to COVID-19; it requires the Board to make certain monthly findings regarding the state of emergency and its impact on the ability to safely meet, and/or the continued imposition or recommendation of measures to promote social distancing. As law, AB 361 sunsets at the end of 2023 but will actually become unavailable on February 28, 2023, because the Governor has announced he will rescind the COVID emergency declaration as of that date. The existence of a state of emergency is one of the findings the Board is required to make in order to participate remotely using the streamlined teleconferencing rules created by AB 361. (See Government Code section 54953(e).)

3. “The Just Cause or Personal Emergency” option created by AB 2449: This new option provides two distinct grounds for a Board or Committee Member to attend remotely: (i) for Just Cause, or (ii) for a Personal Emergency. The legislation provides somewhat complicated criteria that must be satisfied, procedures that must be implemented, and limitations on the number of times a Board Member can rely on these bases to attend remotely. This option is scheduled to sunset at the end of 2025. (See Government Code section 54953(f).) A detailed review of the provisions of AB 2449 is included below.

Using the Just Cause and Personal Emergency options included in AB 2449

As long as the Recycling Board continues to make findings under the COVID Emergency options (AB 361), there is no need for any Board Member to use the Just Cause/Personal Emergency option. The Just Cause/Personal Emergency option is only relevant once the COVID Emergency option (AB 361) is not available.

For a Board member to rely on either the Just Cause or Personal Emergency provisions to remotely attend a Board meeting the following requirements must be met:

1. At least a quorum of the Board must be present at a singular physical location clearly identified on the agenda. If there is less than a quorum at the specified location, then no

1 This is renumbered to Section 54953(e) for 2024 and 2025 after AB 361 sunsets.
Board Member may participate using either the Just Cause or Personal Emergency provisions. If one or more Board Members attending at the specified physical location leave the meeting such that there is less than a quorum at that location, then no Board Members using the Just Cause or Personal Emergency provisions may continue to participate in the meeting. The meeting may continue without those Board Members as long as there is a quorum of Board Members participating in person or from remote locations using “The Usual” option.

2. The Agency must notice the meeting and meet certain minimum technological requirements similar to those currently in place. Specifically, the Recycling Board must provide (1) for public observation of the meeting via either a two-way audiovisual platform, or a two-way telephonic service accompanied by live webcasting; (2) opportunities for the public to comment via a call-in option, an internet-based option, and an in-person location; (3) information on how to observe and comment in all notices of the meeting; and (4) procedural protections to ensure that the Board takes no action during a disruption that prevents the public from observing or commenting on the meeting.

3. The Board Member must participate via both audio and visual technology (e.g., Zoom with camera turned on). If the Board member’s audio or visual connection is lost during the meeting, the Board Member may not participate until the problem is resolved. Note that this requirement differs from “the Usual” option which allows participation by audio only.

4. The Board Member must disclose at the meeting before action is taken whether there are any adults in the room with the Board member and must disclose the general nature of the member’s relationship with any such individuals.

5. The Board Member must not have exceeded the limits on use of the Just Cause and Personal Emergency provisions during the calendar year. No member may participate remotely using those provisions more than three consecutive months or 20 percent of the regular Board meetings within a calendar year. The Recycling Board meets 12 times per year; 20 percent of 12 is 2.4. This means that Board Members may rely on one or both of the Just Cause and Personal Emergency provisions no more than a total of two times per year for Board meetings.

6. The Board Member must inform the Board of their need to participate remotely for Just Cause or a Personal Emergency “at the earliest opportunity possible.” The legislation acknowledges that this may be as late as the start of the meeting in question.

If the requirements above are satisfied, then a Board Member may rely on either the Just Cause or Personal Emergency provisions if the following additional requirements are satisfied:

**Just Cause** – A Board Member may rely on this provision based on a need related to: (a) caregiving for certain family members, (b) a contagious illness, (c) a physical or mental disability, and (d) travelling while on official business for a public agency. The Board Member is required to provide a general description of the circumstances relating to their need to appear remotely for just cause.
**Personal Emergency** – This provision requires the Board to approve remote participation and applies only to medical emergencies for the Board Member or their family. The Board member must request approval of remote participation and provide a general description of the circumstances. This description generally need not exceed 20 words and does not require the member to disclose any medical diagnosis or disability, or any personal medical information that is already exempt under existing law. There must be a separate request for each meeting at which the member wishes to participate remotely. The Board may add such requests to the agenda as an urgency item. The law does not provide any guidance on standards to be used by the Board in considering requests for remote participation.

If the Board chooses to incorporate the provisions of AB 2449 into its Rules of Procedure, staff recommends that the Board add a standing agenda item to receive Just Cause reports and Personal Emergency Requests. In the event of such a report item the Clerk can verify that the baseline procedural requirements above have been satisfied. Note, however, that if a quorum of the Board is not attending from a single physical location, neither option will be available, and the Personal Emergency option will be available only at the discretion of the full Board. For these reasons, once AB 361 is no longer in effect, Board Members unable to attend in person or at a noticed remote location under “The Usual” procedures should consider sending their interim appointee.

The following table summarizes the discussion above.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Public must be allowed to attend in person at Board Member’s remote location?</th>
<th>Usual</th>
<th>Covid Emergency</th>
<th>Just Cause or Personal Emergency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Limit on # of Board Members that can use this option at the same time?</th>
<th>Usual</th>
<th>Covid Emergency</th>
<th>Just Cause or Personal Emergency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No (as long as the Board affirms its interim amendments removing this limit in the Rules of Procedure)</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes, at least a quorum must be present at “a singular physical location clearly identified on the agenda”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Limit on # of times a Board Member can use the option?</th>
<th>Usual</th>
<th>Covid Emergency</th>
<th>Just Cause or Personal Emergency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes, a maximum of two times per calendar year</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Board Member must use both audio + visual technology?</th>
<th>Usual</th>
<th>Covid Emergency</th>
<th>Just Cause or Personal Emergency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No, audio only is acceptable</td>
<td>No, audio only is acceptable</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Quorum of Board Members need to attend from locations in the jurisdiction?</th>
<th>Usual</th>
<th>Covid Emergency</th>
<th>Just Cause or Personal Emergency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes, although can be remote locations within the Alameda County</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes (see note above regarding location of quorum)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Required to provide a physical meeting location for public?</th>
<th>Usual</th>
<th>Covid Emergency</th>
<th>Just Cause or Personal Emergency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes, at standard location where regular meeting held in person + at Board member’s remote location</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Required to provide call-in or internet-based broadcast for public?</strong></td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes, although minimum standards not described</td>
<td>Yes, either a two-way audiovisual platform or a two-way telephonic service + live stream; public must be able to provide comment via a call-in option, an internet-based option, and an in-person location</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Action must stop if broadcast for public disrupted?</strong></td>
<td>No, no express requirement although City could choose to pause until technology issue resolved and may be prudent to do so</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Planned to sunset?</strong></td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes, law sunsets at end of 2023 and is no longer in effect as of February 28, 2023</td>
<td>Yes, sunsets at end of 2025</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**RECOMMENDATION**

Staff recommends that the Recycling Board adopt Resolution 2022-15 to remove the limit on the number of Board Members who may utilize teleconferencing for Board and Committee meetings and to incorporate the Just Cause and Personal Emergency provisions of AB 2449.

Attachment A: #RB Resolution 2022-15
Attachment B: March 10, 2022, Recycling Board Memo and Resolution approving interim amendments to the Rules of Procedure to remove the limit on the number of Board Members who may utilize teleconferencing
ALAMEDA COUNTY SOURCE REDUCTION AND RECYCLING BOARD

RESOLUTION #RB 2022-15

MOVED:
SECONDED:

AT THE MEETING HELD December 8, 2022

AMENDMENTS TO THE RULES OF PROCEDURE REGARDING TELECONFERENCING

WHEREAS, the Recycling Board Rules of Procedure allow no more than two Recycling Board members to utilize teleconferencing at a Board meeting at no more than two teleconferencing locations, and

WHEREAS, on March 10, 2022, the Recycling Board adopted interim amendments to the Board’s Rules of Procedure to remove the limit on the number of Board members who may utilize teleconferencing for Board meetings and directed that the interim amendments remain in place until the end of calendar year 2022, at which time the Board would reevaluate and consider next steps, and

WHEREAS, it is not standard practice for regional legislative bodies to have rules of procedure that limit the number of Board members who may participate by teleconference, the Board has demonstrated that it can efficiently and effectively carry out its work while participating remotely, and having the option to participate remotely creates both environmental and health benefits, and

WHEREAS, Assembly Bill 2449 (Rubio) was signed by the Governor on September 13, 2022 and creates a new limited option for Board members to teleconference for board and committee meetings, and

WHEREAS, amendments to the Recycling Board Rules of Procedure are required in order to incorporate the provisions of AB 2449, and

WHEREAS, the Brown Act sets strict rules for teleconferencing, designed to enable members of the public to access and participate in meetings of legislative bodies at teleconference locations,

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that Section 3-8 of the Alameda County Source Reduction and Recycling Board Rules of Procedure is amended to read as follows:

Teleconferencing. Recycling Board members who are unable to attend a meeting in person may participate in meetings by teleconference in accordance with this section, but are encouraged to have interim appointees attend in their place. Interims are appointed by the Alameda County Waste Management Authority (WMA) Board for WMA representatives, and by the Alameda County Board of Supervisors for county resident representatives. No more than two Recycling Board members may utilize teleconferencing at a Committee/Recycling Board meeting at no more than two teleconferencing locations. A Board member wishing to utilize teleconferencing for a meeting must notify the Executive Director (or designee) prior to the release of the agenda for that meeting of the teleconference location. The teleconference location must be accessible to the public. The Executive Director will identify the teleconference location in the agenda of the meeting and ensure posting of the agenda at the teleconference location. Votes at a Committee/Recycling Board
meeting where teleconferencing is utilized will be taken by roll call. If more than two members request teleconferencing, the two selected shall be chosen on the basis of the order of request, and in the case of ties, by seniority on the Recycling Board. Members shall be compensated for attendance via teleconferencing on the same basis they would be if they were physically present.

A Board member choosing to attend a meeting by teleconference wishing to utilize teleconferencing for a meeting must notify the Executive Director (or designee) prior to the release of the agenda for that meeting, may do so in accordance with the Brown Act as follows:

1. **Noticed Location.** A Recycling Board member wishing to utilize teleconferencing from a noticed location shall notify the Clerk of the Board prior to the release of the agenda for the affected Board meeting of the teleconference location that is accessible to the public. Agendas are typically released seven (7) days in advance of the meeting. The Clerk of the Board will identify the teleconference location in the agenda of the meeting and ensure posting of the agenda at the teleconference location.

2. **Just Cause or Personal Emergency.** A Recycling Board member wishing to utilize teleconferencing under the Brown Act’s just cause or personal emergency procedures shall notify the Clerk of the Board at the earliest opportunity possible, including at the start of a regular meeting, of their need to participate remotely together with a general description of the circumstances relating to their need to appear remotely. If the Board member is requesting authorization to use the personal emergency procedures the Board shall consider, at the outset of the meeting, whether to approve the request. If a quorum of the Board is not participating in person from the StopWaste offices (or other specific physical location clearly identified on the agenda) then no Board member may participate using the just cause or personal emergency procedures. A Board member may teleconference pursuant to this provision no more than two times per year. For the purposes of this subsection 2:

   - The member shall publicly disclose at the meeting before any action is taken whether any other individuals 18 years of age or older are present in the room at the remote location with the member, and the general nature of the member’s relationship with any such individuals.

   - The member shall participate through both audio and visual technology.

   - “Emergency circumstances” means a physical or family medical emergency that prevents a member from attending in person.

   - “Just cause” means any of the following: (1) A childcare or caregiving need of a child, parent, grandparent, grandchild, sibling, spouse, or domestic partner that requires them to participate remotely; (2) A contagious illness that prevents a member from attending in person; (3) A need related to a physical or mental disability; (4) Travel while on official business of the Recycling Board or another state or local agency.

Recycling Board members who are unable to attend a meeting in person or at a noticed remote location are encouraged to have interim appointees attend in their place. Interims are appointed by the Alameda County Waste Management Authority (WMA) Board for WMA representatives, and by the Alameda County Board of Supervisors for county resident representatives.
Votes at a Committee/Recycling Board meeting where teleconferencing is utilized will be taken by roll call and all other applicable requirements of the Brown Act will be followed. If more than two members request teleconferencing, the two selected shall be chosen on the basis of the order of request, and in the case of ties, by seniority on the Recycling Board. Members shall be compensated for attendance via teleconferencing on the same basis they would be if they were physically present.

**BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED,** that the Board recommends that the Alameda County Waste Management Authority (ACWMA) Board make conforming amendments to its Rules of Procedure to the extent that they apply to the ACWMA Planning Committee.

**Effective date and Expiration Date.** The Resolution shall take effect on March 1, 2023 and expire on December 31, 2025.

Passed and adopted this 8th day of December 2022 by the following vote:

**AYES:**

**NOES:**

**ABSENT:**

**ABSTAINED:**

________________________
Arliss Dunn, Clerk of the Board
DATE: March 10, 2022
TO: Recycling Board
FROM: Timothy Burroughs, Executive Director
SUBJECT: Rules of Procedure for Teleconferencing at Recycling Board Meetings

SUMMARY
The Recycling Board Rules of Procedure, which are approved and can be revised by a majority of the total authorized vote of the Board, state that no more than two Board members may utilize teleconferencing for a Recycling Board meeting at no more than two teleconferencing locations. Further, the Brown Act sets strict rules for teleconferencing, designed to enable members of the public to access and participate in Board meetings at each teleconference location. The purpose of this memo is for the Recycling Board to consider interim amendments to the Rules of Procedure, consistent with the Brown Act, to remove the limit on the number of Board members who may utilize teleconferencing for Board meetings and to advise staff on the preferred start time for meetings held in each of the five supervisorial districts. The interim amendments would be in place until the end of calendar year 2022, at which time the Board would revisit and consider next steps.

DISCUSSION
In order to promote public health and safety, the Recycling Board has met exclusively by teleconference since the onset of the COVID-19 pandemic in March 2020. Initially, it was an Executive Order issued by the Governor that streamlined legislative body teleconferencing by suspending certain Brown Act rules, including the requirements that all teleconference locations be made available for the public, that each teleconference location be identified on the agenda, and that the agenda be posted at each teleconference location. Then, on September 16, 2021, the Governor signed AB 361 into law, which amends the Brown Act to allow local legislative bodies to continue to meet by teleconference as they did under the Executive Order, subject to various procedural safeguards that have consistently been a part of the Board’s practice. The “streamlined” teleconferencing pursuant to AB 361 is allowed only when the Governor has declared a state of emergency and the legislative body confirms every 30 days that state or local health officials have imposed or recommended measures to promote social distancing. At such time as the streamlined procedures are no longer in place, the Board’s standard Rules of Procedure will take effect. If the
Board makes interim amendments to the Rules of Procedure regarding teleconferencing, then those changes would become effective at that time instead.

The main amendment that staff is recommending that the Board consider is to remove the limit on the number of Board members who may utilize teleconferencing for Board meetings. The current Rules of Procedure also “encourage” Board members who are unable to attend a meeting in person, but are able to participate by teleconference, to have an interim appointee attend in their place (see Attachment 1, Section 3-8). Staff recommends that this aspect of the current Rules of Procedure – namely, encouraging Board members to appoint an interim Board member rather than participate via teleconference – no longer apply. Finally, staff recommends that the Board make these amendments on an interim basis, until the end of calendar year 2022, at which time the Board would reevaluate the interim rules and decide on next steps.

Having corresponded with several other public agencies that operate in Alameda County and the Bay Area, staff has found that it is not standard practice for regional legislative bodies to have rules of procedure that limit the number of board members who may participate by teleconference. Public agencies throughout the region are in the process of setting up “hybrid” meeting procedures, meaning that members of the legislative body, agency staff, and members of the public may participate in Board meetings either in person or via teleconference.

If the Board chooses to adopt interim amendments to the rules of procedure, then staff will provide specific instructions for Board members to ensure that Brown Act rules are followed. Specifically, the Brown Act requires the following once the streamlined procedures of AB 361 are no longer in effect:

- At least a quorum of the legislative body must participate from locations within the local agency’s jurisdiction (i.e., Alameda County);
- Each teleconference location must be specifically identified in the notice and agenda of the meeting, including a full address and room number, as may be applicable;
- Agendas must be posted at each teleconference location, even if a hotel room or a residence;
- Each teleconference location, including a hotel room or residence, must be accessible to the public and have technology, such as a speakerphone, to enable the public to participate;
- The agenda must provide the opportunity for the public to address the legislative body directly at each teleconference location; and
- All votes must be by roll call.

Importantly, once a teleconference location is noticed to the public, Board members must ensure that someone is at the location at the time of the meeting to provide public access to the space and to provide the public the ability to make comments. Also, Board members must provide the Clerk of the Board with their meeting location details at least one week prior to the Board meeting to ensure that the Agency meets required noticing deadlines.

In addition, per the Alameda County Waste Reduction and Recycling Initiative Charter Amendment (Measure D) that created the Recycling Board, the Board is required to continue to hold at least one
regularly scheduled evening meeting per year in each supervisorial district in a location accessible by public transit and that ensures full access to all Recycling Board meetings by the physically disabled. Agency staff will coordinate with StopWaste member agencies in each supervisorial district to identify appropriate locations that are equipped for teleconferencing and adhere to Measure D requirements.

The Board’s practice, although it is not in the Rules of Procedure, is to start the evening meetings held in each of the five supervisorial districts at 7:00 pm. In other words, the Board’s practice is to meet five times per year at 7:00 pm, while the other meetings begin at 4pm. Staff would like Board direction on if a 6:00 pm start time would be preferable.

Finally, staff encourages Board members to attend the last meeting of the calendar year in person to review 2022 accomplishments and prepare for the new year.

RECOMMENDATION

Adopt Resolution #RB 2022-04 to approve interim amendments to the Rules of Procedure to remove the limit on the number of Board members who may teleconference for Board meetings, and to start each of the five meetings held in the five supervisorial districts at 6:00 pm. The interim amendments to the Rules of Procedure would be in effect until the end of calendar year 2022, at which time the Board would reevaluate and consider next steps.

Attachment 1: Current Alameda County Source Reduction Recycling Board Rules of Procedure
ALAMEDA COUNTY SOURCE REDUCTION AND RECYCLING BOARD

RESOLUTION # RB 2022-04

MOVED:
SECONDED:

AT THE MEETING HELD MARCH 10, 2022

INTERIM AMENDMENTS TO THE RULES OF PROCEDURE REGARDING TELECONFERENCEING AND PERMANENT REVISION TO START TIME FOR EVENING MEETINGS

WHEREAS, the Recycling Board Rules of Procedure allow no more than two Recycling Board members to utilize teleconferencing at a Recycling Board meeting at no more than two teleconferencing locations, and

WHEREAS, these limitations were suspended during the COVID-19 public health emergency to allow all Board members to participate via teleconference to protect public health and safety and will take effect at such time as the Board resumes in person meetings, and

WHEREAS, the Brown Act sets strict rules for teleconferencing, designed to enable members of the public to access and participate in board meetings at teleconference locations, and

WHEREAS, having corresponded with several other public agencies that operate in Alameda County and the Bay Area, staff has found that it is not standard practice for regional legislative bodies to have rules of procedure that limit the number of board members who may participate by teleconference, and

WHEREAS, staff is recommending that the Recycling Board consider removing the limit on the number of Board members who may utilize teleconferencing for Board meetings for an interim period, until the end of calendar year 2022, and

WHEREAS, the Alameda County Waste Reduction and Recycling Initiative Charter Amendment (Measure D) requires the Recycling Board to hold at least one regularly scheduled evening meeting per year in each supervisorial district, and

WHEREAS, the Board’s practice is to start the meetings held in each of the five supervisorial districts at 7:00 pm, and that staff is proposing a start time of 6:00 pm.

NOW THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Alameda County Source Reduction and Recycling Board consider and approve removing the limit on the number of Board members who may utilize teleconferencing for Board meetings, and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that removing the limit on the number of Board members who may utilize teleconferencing for Board meetings is approved on an interim basis by this resolution, through the end of calendar year 2022, at which time the Board will consider and provide direction on next steps, and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that Section 3-8 of the Alameda County Source Reduction and Recycling Board Rules of Procedure is amended on an interim basis until December 31, 2022, to read as follows:

Section 3-8 Teleconferencing. Recycling Board members unable to attend a meeting in person may participate in meetings by teleconference in accordance with this section, but are encouraged to have interim appointees attend in their place. Interims are appointed by the Alameda County Waste Management Authority (WMA) Board for WMA representatives, and by
the Alameda County Board of Supervisors for county resident representatives. No more than two Recycling Board members may utilize teleconferencing at a Committee/Recycling Board meeting at no more than two teleconferencing locations. A Board member wishing to utilize teleconferencing for a meeting must notify the Executive Director (or designee) prior to the release of the agenda for that meeting, of the teleconference location. The teleconference location must be accessible to the public. The Executive Director will identify the teleconference location in the agenda of the meeting and ensure posting of the agenda at the teleconference location. Votes at a Committee/Recycling Board meeting where teleconferencing is utilized will be taken by roll call. If more than two members request teleconferencing, the two selected shall be chosen on the basis of the order of request, and in the case of ties, by seniority on the Recycling Board. Members shall be compensated for attendance via teleconferencing on the same basis they would be if they were physically present.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Board directs that the Board meetings held in each supervisorial district shall begin at 6:00 pm moving forward, and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Board recommends that the Alameda County Waste Management Authority (ACWMA) Board make conforming amendments to its Rules of Procedure to the extent that they apply to the ACWMA Planning Committee.

Effective Date and Expiration Date. This Resolution shall take effect immediately upon its adoption, and expire on December 31, 2022.

Passed and adopted this 10th day of March 2022 by the following vote:

AYES:

NOES:

ABSENT:

ABSTAINED:

________________________
Arliss Dunn, Clerk of the Board
ATTACHMENT 1

ALAMEDA COUNTY SOURCE REDUCTION AND RECYCLING BOARD
RULES OF PROCEDURE

Revised July 12, 2018

Article 1
General Provisions

Section 1-1 Name of Board. The name of the Board is the Alameda County Source Reduction and Recycling Board, hereinafter referenced as the "Recycling Board".

Section 1-2 Authority for Rules. These rules apply to the Recycling Board (including Committees of the Recycling Board), and are adopted pursuant to the Initiative Charter Amendment known as County of Alameda Charter Section 64, hereinafter "Initiative", which became effective December 20, 1990, and is hereby incorporated by this reference.

Section 1-3 Purpose of Rules. The purpose of these rules is to provide for the orderly conduct of meetings of the Recycling Board.

Article 2
Organization of Board

Section 2-1 Composition of Recycling Board. The Recycling Board is composed of eleven (11) members appointed pursuant to the Initiative creating the Recycling Board.

Section 2-2 Officers. The Officers of the Recycling Board shall be President, First Vice-President and Second Vice-President, who shall serve until the elections of their successor in accordance with Section 2-4.

Section 2-3 Committees. The Recycling Board may appoint such committees from time to time as may be appropriate to administer the powers and programs of the Recycling Board. A majority of Recycling Board appointed committee members shall constitute a quorum of the committee. A majority vote of the committee members in attendance shall be required for the transaction of business, however, the committee is not empowered to take final action on behalf of the Recycling Board. All other rules followed by the Recycling Board apply to committee meetings unless otherwise determined by the committee. Committee Chairs, or the procedure for selection of a committee Chair, shall be specified by the Recycling Board when the committee is appointed.

In addition to the aforementioned, any committee that constitutes a quorum of the Recycling Board (see Section 3-5) shall be noticed as both a meeting of the committee and a meeting of the Recycling Board.

The Executive Director or designee shall monitor the composition of all Committees on which one or more Recycling Board members sit and notice the meetings as appropriate and required in compliance with the Ralph M. Brown Act (California Government Code Section 54950 et.seq), requiring open and public meetings for the legislative body of a local agency.

Section 2-4 Election of Officers. The Officers shall be elected at the regular meeting of the Recycling Board in the month of December of each year or such other time as the Board may decide when an officer departs the Recycling Board. They shall be elected by a majority of
those present and voting. An abstention to vote by any member shall be construed as
that member not voting. No member may serve more than one term in the same
leadership position on the Recycling Board within a two-year time frame. This does not
limit a person who has served in one office for a year serving in a different office the
following year (e.g., the First Vice President in one year serving as the President the next
year).

Section 2-5 **Term of Office.** Each term of office shall be no more than one (1) year duration,
commencing January 1 or such other time as the Board may require to fill vacancies, and
expiring December 31 of the same calendar year.

Section 2-6 **Executive Director.** The Executive Director of the Recycling Board shall be the Executive
Director of the Alameda County Waste Management Authority Board.

Section 2-7 **Duties of President.** The President shall serve as Chair and preside at all meetings of the
Recycling Board, and shall conduct the business of the Recycling Board in the manner
prescribed by these Rules. The President shall preserve order and decorum using the
Rules of Conduct of Meetings listed in Article 4 and the discussion ground rules listed in
Article 4, and shall decide all questions of order subject to the action of a majority of the
Recycling Board.

Section 2-8 **Duties of the First and Second Vice-President.** In the absence or inability of the
President to act, the Vice-Presidents shall perform the duties of the President in order of
their succession.

Section 2-9 **Duties of the Executive Director.** The Executive Director shall perform the following duties:
   a) Attend each meeting of the Recycling Board.
   b) Prepare an agenda for each meeting.
   c) Appoint a Clerk of the Board to:
      • Notify all Recycling Board members of the time and place of each meeting;
      • Maintain all records of the Recycling Board;
      • Maintain a record of the proceedings of Recycling Board and committee meetings;
   d) Perform other duties directed by law or the Recycling Board. These duties may be
delegated as determined necessary by the Executive Director.

**Article 3**
Meetings of Recycling Board

Section 3-1 **Regular Meetings.** Regular meetings of the Recycling Board will be set by a majority vote
of those present and voting. An abstention to vote by any member shall be construed as
that member not voting.

Section 3-2 **Special Meetings.** Special meetings of the Recycling Board may be called by order of the
President of the Recycling Board or by a majority of the members at a regularly
scheduled meeting. The order calling the special meeting shall specify the time of the
meeting and the business to be transacted at such meeting.

Section 3-3 **Adjourned Meetings.** Any regular meeting of the Recycling Board may be adjourned to
any date prior to the date established for the next regular meeting. Any adjourned
regular meeting is part of the regular meeting. Any special meeting may also be
adjourned, and any adjourned special meeting is part of the special meeting.
Section 3-4  **Effect of Holiday.** If any meeting day or adjourned meeting day falls on a holiday, the meeting of the Recycling Board shall be rescheduled by the Recycling Board.

Section 3-5  **Quorum.** A majority of the members of the Recycling Board shall constitute a quorum for the transaction of business, except that less than a quorum may adjourn from time to time pursuant to Section 3-6 of these Rules.

Section 3-6  **Absence of Quorum.** In the absence of a quorum, the members present shall adjourn the meeting to a stated time and place, and the absent members shall be notified. If all members are absent, the Executive Director or a representative shall adjourn the meeting to a stated time and place and notify all members pursuant to Section 3-7 of these Rules.

Section 3-7  **Notice of Meetings.** All meetings of the Recycling Board shall be held subject to the provisions of the Ralph M. Brown Act (California Government Code section 54950 et seq.) requiring open and public meetings for the legislative body of a local agency. Agendas will typically be released five (5) days in advance of regular meetings.

Section 3-8  **Teleconferencing.** Recycling Board members unable to attend a meeting in person may participate in meetings by teleconference in accordance with this section, but are encouraged to have interim appointees attend in their place. Interims are appointed by the Alameda County Waste Management Authority (WMA) Board for WMA representatives, and by the Alameda County Board of Supervisors for county resident representatives. No more than two Recycling Board members may utilize teleconferencing at a Committee/Recycling Board meeting at no more than two teleconferencing locations. A Board member wishing to utilize teleconferencing for a meeting must notify the Executive Director (or designee) prior to the release of the agenda for that meeting, of the teleconference location. The teleconference location must be accessible to the public. The Executive Director will identify the teleconference location in the agenda of the meeting and ensure posting of the agenda at the teleconference location. Votes at a Committee/Recycling Board meeting where teleconferencing is utilized will be taken by roll call. If more than two members request teleconferencing, the two selected shall be chosen on the basis of the order of request, and in the case of ties, by seniority on the Recycling Board. Members shall be compensated for attendance via teleconferencing on the same basis they would be if they were physically present.

Section 3-9  **Compensation.** Recycling Board members and interim appointments are compensated in accordance with compensation policies approved by the Recycling Board. Recycling Board members must attend a Recycling Board meeting to be compensated for that meeting.

**Article 4**
**Conduct of Meetings**

Section 4-1  **Order of Business.** The Business of each meeting of the Recycling Board shall be transacted as far as is practicable in the following order:
(a) Call to order  
(b) Roll call of attendance  
(c) Announcements by President  
(d) Open public comment  
(e) Approval of minutes of prior meetings (may be included in the consent calendar)
(f) Consent calendar
(g) Regular calendar
(h) Member Comments and communications from the Executive Director; and
(i) Adjournment

The above order of business may be suspended or changed at any time upon order of the Chair. The consent calendar may contain those matters the nature of which have been determined by the Executive Director to be routine, and items that have been recommended by a Committee for Recycling Board approval, and will be approved by a single action. Any item shall be removed from the consent calendar and placed for discussion on the regular calendar at the request of any member. Recycling Board members who were not in attendance at a meeting but have read the minutes of the meeting may vote in connection with approval of those minutes. The regular calendar shall contain all other matters and business.

Open public comment from the floor is provided for any member of the public wishing to speak on any matter within the jurisdiction of the Recycling Board, but not listed on the agenda. Each speaker is limited to three minutes unless a shorter period of time is set by the Chair.

Section 4-2 Right of Floor. Any member desiring to speak shall first be recognized by the Chair and shall, with the exception of open public comment period, confine any remarks to the subject under consideration.

Section 4-3 Ground Rules for Recycling Board and Committee Discussions:
   a) Speak briefly and to the point.
   b) Focus on solutions rather than positions. If disagreeing, offer an alternative rather than merely stating disagreement.
   c) Seek input from those who have not spoken before anyone speaks a second time on a given agenda item.
   d) Seek group consensus and use voting only when further discussion seems unlikely to change the outcome, or circumstances require an immediate decision.
   e) Consensus on any item shall be stated for the written record by the meeting Chair. All motions shall be stated for the written record prior to voting.
   f) Identify the next step at the end of each agenda item.
   g) The meeting Chair shall prevent personal, verbal attacks on Recycling Board members, staff, or citizens, but shall not prevent criticisms of the policies, procedures, programs or services of the Recycling Board, or the acts or omissions of the Recycling Board or members of the Recycling Board.
   h) The meeting Chair, but no other member, may interrupt a speaker to enforce these rules.
   i) Serious complaints from one Recycling Board member about the behavior of another Recycling Board member shall be first brought to the attention of the Chair.

Section 4-4 Procedures Regarding Public Hearings and Action Items
   (a) Introduction
      1) Chair announces subject of the public hearings and declares the public hearing open.
      2) Chair may set time limit for each speaker and may limit number of appearances per speaker.
(b) Staff and Written Material Presentation
   1.) Staff summary report and other written material included in the agenda packet is received and filed. Written comments (e.g. protest, etc.) are noted for the record.
   2.) Written material not in the agenda packet, if any, is received and filed.
   3.) Oral staff report, if any, is presented by staff member.
   4.) Staff responds to Recycling Board member questions.

(c) Public Comment
   1.) The purpose of this portion of the public hearing is to provide an opportunity to concerned members in the audience who wish to testify in support of or opposition to the matter being heard.
   2.) The Chair shall instruct members of the audience:
      (a) to speak from the podium;
      (b) to give their name and address before speaking;
      (c) that repetition should be avoided.
   3.) Question by speakers will be noted and addressed prior to Recycling Board deliberation.

(d) Recycling Board Deliberation
   1.) After the Chair has determined that no other member of the audience wishes to speak, the matter is returned to the Recycling Board for deliberation.
   2.) The Chair may ask questions of speakers for clarification.
   3.) Staff and/or Recycling Board answers prior speakers’ questions.
   4.) The Recycling Board makes a motion and debates.

(e) Recycling Board Action
   1.) Recycling Board may, at this time, continue the open public hearing.
      (a) This should be done if any additional information is requested (e.g. a staff report).
      (b) Continuing a public hearing to a specific date does not require additional notice.
   2.) The Recycling Board may:
      (a) close the public hearings and vote on the item;
      (b) offer amendments or substitute motions allowing additional public comment; or
      (c) close the public hearing and continue the matter to a later date for a decision. (No additional reports or testimony may be received after the hearing has been closed).

Section 4-5 Precedence of Motions

When a motion is pending before the Recycling Board, no further motion shall be entertained except:

(a) Motion to Amend – A motion to amend is debatable only as it relates to the amendment.
An amendment which modifies the motion is in order; however, a substitute motion is in order if the intent is changed. A substitute motion on the same subject shall be acceptable, and voted on before a vote on the amendment. Amendments are voted on first; the main motion vote is last. A motion may be amended more than once with each amendment being voted on separately. There shall only be one amending motion on the floor at any one time.

(b) Motion to Postpone – A motion to postpone to a date uncertain is debatable. If such a motion is adopted, the principal question is lost. A motion to postpone to a definite time is subject to debate and amendment only as it relates to propriety of the postponement and time set.

(c) Motion to Table – A motion to table is not debatable and not subject to amendment. A motion to table is only in order when another item later on the agenda is time-sensitive. The tabled item is taken up for discussion upon completion of the time-sensitive item.

Section 4-6 Motion to Reconsider

A motion to reconsider any action taken by the Recycling Board must be made at the same meeting where the item was first voted upon, in accordance with the following:

(1) The motion must be made by a member who voted on the prevailing side, when the item was first voted upon; and

(2) The motion is debatable and has precedence over a pending motion.

Section 4-7 Comments from the Public

Recycling Board members may ask questions but the Recycling Board shall not discuss or act in connection with such citizen comment, if the subject is not on the agenda for action. A Recycling Board member may, however, refer a subject to staff or other resources for factual information or for action, if appropriate. In addition, members of the public may comment on any item if recognized for that purpose by the meeting Chair. The Chair has full discretion over the time allowed for public input.

Section 4-8 Parliamentary Rules. The rules laid down by Rosenberg’s Rules of Order are hereby adopted for this Recycling Board in all cases not otherwise provided for in these rules.

Section 4-9 Vote Required. A majority of the total authorized vote of the Recycling Board shall be required for the adoption of the following:

(a) Adopt the annual work program and budget

(b) Adopt policies, rules of procedure, etc. for operations of the Recycling Board and staff

A majority vote of those present and voting shall be required for any other action. An abstention to vote by any member shall be construed as that member not voting on a particular matter.

Section 4-10 Interim Member Vote. An interim member may vote on any matter under consideration only in the absence of the regular member from the meeting.
Section 4-11 **Roll Call.** Each roll call of the Recycling Board shall be in alphabetical order, except that the Chair shall be called last.

Section 4-12 **Roll Call Votes.** Roll call votes shall proceed in the following manner:

(a) The Chair will direct the Clerk of the Board to report on the Recycling Board members who have joined or left the meeting since the roll call of attendance at the beginning of the meeting;

(b) The Chair will ask for a voice vote on the matter;

(c) If there are no “nay” votes or abstentions, the Chair will direct that the matter be reported as passed unanimously with the names of all Recycling Board members in attendance reported as voting in favor;

(d) If there are any “nay” votes or abstentions, the Chair will direct the Clerk of the Board to call the name of each member and record the vote of the member and then report the total number of “aye,” “nay” and “abstain” votes. The Chair shall be called last.

Section 4-13 **Roll Call Not Required.** The roll need not be called in voting upon a motion except when requested by a member. If the roll is not called, in the absence of objection, the Chair may order the motion unanimously approved.

Section 4-14 **Voting Ineligibility.** Any Recycling Board member attending a Recycling Board meeting and ineligible to vote on any matter under consideration by the Recycling Board at that meeting shall briefly describe the reason for being ineligible and then shall leave the Recycling Board table before the matter is considered and refrain from participation in any action concerning the matter. If the member is ineligible due to a conflict of interest under the Political Reform Act, the member’s disclosure shall include the information required by that Act and the member shall leave the room and not be counted towards a quorum. Notwithstanding the foregoing, a member is not required to leave the Recycling Board table or room for matters that are on the consent calendar.

Section 4-15 **Ex Parte Communications.** Ex parte communication report forms should be submitted only for ex parte communications that are made after the matter has been put on the Recycling Board’s agenda, giving as much public notice as possible.
PLANNING COMMITTEE & RECYCLING BOARD

2023 MEETING SCHEDULE

The regular meeting schedule for the Planning Committee & Recycling Board is the second Thursday of each month at 4:00 p.m. or 6:00 p.m., except where noted differently (*). Meetings are held at StopWaste, 1537 Webster Street, Oakland, CA, unless noted otherwise.

All meetings held at an in-person location will also include hybrid meeting access, e.g., via Zoom or telephone.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DATE</th>
<th>TIME</th>
<th>LOCATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>January 12</td>
<td>4:00 p.m.</td>
<td>Teleconference</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>February 9</td>
<td>6:00 p.m.</td>
<td>Teleconference</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>March 9</td>
<td>4:00 p.m.</td>
<td>StopWaste, 1537 Webster Street, Oakland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>April 26</td>
<td>3:00 p.m.</td>
<td>StopWaste, 1537 Webster Street, Oakland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6:00 p.m.</td>
<td>District 3 - San Leandro</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>13909 E 14th St, San Leandro, CA 94578</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June 8</td>
<td>4:00 p.m.</td>
<td>StopWaste, 1537 Webster Street, Oakland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>July 13</td>
<td>6:00 p.m.</td>
<td>District 2 – Fremont</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Location TBD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>August 10</td>
<td>4:00 p.m.</td>
<td>StopWaste, 1537 Webster Street, Oakland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>September 14</td>
<td>6:00 p.m.</td>
<td>District 1 – Livermore</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Civic Center Meeting Hall</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1016 S. Livermore Avenue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Livermore, CA 94550</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>October 12</td>
<td>4:00 p.m.</td>
<td>StopWaste, 1537 Webster Street, Oakland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>November 15</td>
<td>3:00 p.m.</td>
<td>StopWaste, 1537 Webster Street, Oakland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6:00 p.m.</td>
<td>District 5 – Oakland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>StopWaste, 1537 Webster Street, Oakland</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

RECOMMENDATION

That the Planning Committee and Recycling Board approve the 2023 meeting schedule.
This page intentionally left blank
DATE: December 8, 2022

TO: Recycling Board

FROM: Timothy Burroughs, Executive Director

SUBJECT: Election of Officers for 2023

SUMMARY

The Recycling Board Rules of Procedure call for election of officers in December for the next calendar year. Nominations and elections will be held at the December 8, 2022, meeting.

DISCUSSION

Board Member Francisco Zermeño is the current President, Board Member Laura McKaughan is First Vice President, and Board Member Dan Kalb is the Second Vice President. Per past practice, Board Member McKaughan would become President, Board Member Kalb, the First Vice President, and the Board must elect a Second Vice President. The Board usually alternates officers between WMA appointees and Board of Supervisor appointees. To that end, a Board of Supervisor appointee would be elected as Second Vice President.

RECOMMENDATION

That the Recycling Board elect Officers for calendar year 2023.