

APPROVED

**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE
PLANNING & ORGANIZATION COMMITTEE
AND
ALAMEDA COUNTY RECYCLING BOARD**

**Thursday, February 11, 2016
4:00 p.m.**

**StopWaste Offices
1537 Webster Street
Oakland, CA 94612
510-891-6500**

I. CALL TO ORDER

President Tim Rood called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m.

II. ROLL CALL

Tim Rood, City of Piedmont, Chair
Adan Alonzo, Recycling Programs
Don Biddle for Jerry Pentin, City of Pleasanton
Bernie Larrabe, Recycling Materials Processing Industry
Peter Maass, City of Albany
Dianne Martinez, City of Emeryville
Daniel O'Donnell, Environmental Organization
Toni Stein, Environmental Educator
Steve Sherman, Source Reduction Specialist
Shelia Young for Greg Jones, City of Hayward

Absent

Michael Peltz, Solid Waste Industry Representative

Staff Present:

Wendy Sommer, Executive Director
Tom Padia, Deputy Executive Director
Pat Cabrera, Administrative Services Director
Gina Peters, Chief Financial Officer
Judi Ettlenger, Senior Program Manager
Justin Lehrer, Senior Program Manager
Meghan Starkey, Senior Program Manager
Audrey Beaman, County Counsel
Arliss Dunn, Clerk of the Board

Others Participating:

Maria DiMiglio, City of Alameda
Andrew Schneider, City of Berkeley
Brett Oeverndiek, City of Newark
Arthur Boone, Former Recycling Board Member

III. ANNOUNCEMENTS BY THE PRESIDENT

There were none.

IV. CONSENT CALENDAR

APPROVED

- | | |
|--|--------------------|
| 1. Approval of the Draft Minutes of January 14, 2016 (Wendy Sommer) | Action |
| 2. Board Attendance Record (Wendy Sommer) | Information |
| 3. Written Report of Ex Parte Communications (Wendy Sommer) | Information |

Board member Martinez made the motion to approve the Consent Calendar. Board member Biddle seconded and the motion carried 9-0 (Stein and Peltz absent).

V. OPEN PUBLIC DISCUSSION

There was none.

VI. REGULAR CALENDAR

- | | |
|---|--------------------|
| 1. Community Murals (Judi Ettlenger) | Information |
| This item is for information only. | |

Judi Ettlenger provided an overview of the project and presented an online “flipbook” of the murals. A link to the presentation is available here: [Murals-02-11-16](#)

Board member Maass stated his appreciation for the murals and inquired if any of the paint used was from the HHW program. Ms. Ettlenger stated no, the artists use aerosol can paint. Ms. Ettlenger added there will be another mural in Dublin. Board member Sherman inquired regarding the follow up to this project. Ms. Ettlenger stated that the murals will be featured on our website and staff will be asking the Board during the FY 16-17 budget process to allocate additional funding to do more community murals. President Rood thanked Ms. Ettlenger for the presentation.

- | | |
|---|--------------------|
| 2. Annual Audit for Fiscal Year 2014-15 (Pat Cabrera & Gina Peters) | Information |
| Staff recommends that the P&A and the P&O Committees review and forward the audit report to the Waste Management Authority and Energy Council for acceptance and filing, and that the Recycling Board accept and file the audit report. | |

Gina Peters provided an overview of the staff report and Katherine Yuen, Maze and Associates presented a PowerPoint presentation. The combined report and presentation is available here: [Audit Report-02-11-16](#)

Board member Martinez expressed appreciation to staff for the great work and transparency with respect to the audit report. She highlighted the auditors opinions expressed on the financial statements that the agency received an unmodified (clean) audit opinion, no control deficiencies, no material weaknesses, and no significant deficiencies. Ms. Sommer added that staff will be going to the WMA Board with options to address the unfunded liability as well as multi-year revenue projections.

Board member Maass inquired about the inclusion of the HHW budget in the agency financials for the first time. Ms. Sommer stated that this is pass-through funding allocated to the County through an MOU signed last year. Board member Sherman inquired about the sensitivity of the proportionate share of the net pension liability to changes in the discount rate and inquired if the 1% increase is significant. Ms. Yuen stated yes. She added that the data reported in the audit report is as of June 30, 2014, so any market fluctuation is a year delayed. Board member Sherman inquired if the audit contained a note advising the agency on how to handle such a change in valuation. Ms. Cabrera stated that each year the agency receives a valuation report from PERS. Staff will be presenting to the WMA Board on February 17 different scenarios regarding the unfunded liability (UL) and establishing a percentage target for funding the UL. Board member Rood illustrated that staff hired prior to 2007 received a more generous post-employment retirement benefit package than staff hired after 2007 and inquired if there would be amounts included in next year’s audit report. Ms. Cabrera stated that the amount is currently included

and the agency is fully funded for post-retirement medical benefits and we are now making the normal payment requirements.

Board member Biddle made the motion that the P&O Committee forward the audit report to the Waste Management Authority and Energy Council for acceptance and filing, and that the Recycling Board accept and file the audit report. Board member Martinez seconded and the motion carried 10-0 (Peltz absent).

- 3. Assessment Criteria for Product Decisions Activities (Justin Lehrer) Information**
Staff recommends that the Board review and approve proposed criteria for evaluating targets and programs.

Justin Lehrer provided an overview of the staff report and presented a PowerPoint presentation. The combined report and presentation is available here: [PD Criteria-02-11-16](#)

Ms. Sommer informed the Board that the criteria were presented to the P&A Committee earlier today and they were supportive. They inquired if staff had considered adding a scoring mechanism. Staff discussed including such a mechanism but could not determine a workable approach and will continue to explore incorporating some type of scoring criteria. Additionally, the Committee asked that staff provide a mock sample project using the proposed criteria. Mr. Lehrer stated in March staff will bring two sample product decisions yes/no projects in which the criteria was used to determine the outcome of the projects.

Board member Stein commended staff on an excellent presentation and stated that the information looks great. However, she would like to see the criteria include a resilience transition plan and consider the unintended consequences of success, i.e. who would be hurt or displaced. Mr. Lehrer stated that this consideration prompted staff to include the Community/Social Impact criteria. Board member Martinez stated that she appreciates having a guiding document to direct our projects and supports staff having this tool. She further inquired about how the criteria will affect our current projects. Mr. Lehrer stated that staff will use the proposed criteria to evaluate current projects and bring recommendations to the Board. This could mean redirecting resources from projects, combining resources for specific projects or even sunseting projects where staff feels we have reached our plateau. Board member Maass stated that he considers the criteria a great start that may need to be tweaked as we begin using to use it.

Board member Sherman stated that the development criteria is timely and encouraged staff to give extra weight to waste reduction in a broader scope and encouraged staff to look how much of the agency's budget is allocated towards the 4Rs (Reduce, Reuse, Recycle, Rot) to see how we are aligned with our mission. Mr. Lehrer stated that including the 4Rs as hierarchy when developing criteria helps us assess the weighting of the targets. Board member Biddle commented that with the diversity of our projects it is helpful to have the 4Rs prominently defined in the hierarchy and added it is also timely in developing criteria prior to budget discussions and it will guide the agency in developing future projects as well. Board member Young inquired about the methodology that will be used to move ahead with a project, e.g. scoring yes/no, etc. Mr. Lehrer stated that the criteria initially included a yes/no weighted scoring system and will continue to explore incorporating scoring criteria.

Arthur Boone provided public comment regarding how to look at hard to recycle materials.

Board member Martinez made the motion to approve the staff recommendation. Board member Stein seconded and the motion carried 10-0 (Peltz absent).

Ms. Sommer informed the Board that the next steps will be to bring proposed targets adjustments to the Board in March. The April 14 RB meeting will be canceled in lieu of a joint WMA/EC/RB budget workshop on April 27 at 3:00 pm.

4. Municipal Panel Presentation: Special Events Recycling (Meghan Starkey) Information
This item is for information only.

Meghan Starkey provided an overview of the staff report ([Municipal Panel-02-11-16](#)) and introduced the panel participants: Maria DiMeglio, City of Alameda; Andrew Schneider, City of Berkeley; and Brett Oeverndiek, City of Newark. The panelists shared the types of events that are held in their respective cities, how the logistics are handled and the results of collection of recycling and/or organics, as well as the chief challenges of event recycling. Board members asked how the agency can help cities with this effort. Board member Maass inquired if a standard for utensils would help. Ms. Sommer suggested that we bring this item to TAC for staff input. An audio of the discussion is available here: [Municipal Panel Discussion-02-11-16](#)

Board members suggested the following list of items for future Municipal Panel discussions:

1. Trash and Recycling Enclosures
2. Construction and Demolition Debris Recycling
3. Measuring Diversion (Tips and techniques employed by cities to divert organics from the trash)

VII. OTHER PUBLIC INPUT

There was none.

VIII. COMMUNICATIONS/MEMBER COMMENTS

Board member Sherman announced that NCRA (the Northern California Recycling Association) is holding its annual recycling update on Tuesday, March 22, 2016. Information about the event is available here: [ZWW/Recycling Update/2016](#)

IX. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 5:40 p.m.