

**APPROVED**

**MINUTES OF REGULAR MEETING OF THE  
PLANNING COMMITTEE  
AND  
ALAMEDA COUNTY RECYCLING BOARD**

**Thursday, January 9, 2020**

**4:00 P.M.**

**StopWaste  
1537 Webster Street  
Oakland, CA 94612  
510-891-6500**

**I. CALL TO ORDER**

First Vice President Deborah Cox called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m.

**II. ROLL CALL OF ATTENDANCE**

Jillian Buckholz, Recycling Programs  
Bernie Camara, Recycling Materials Processing Industry  
Bob Carling, ACWMA  
Deborah Cox, ACWMA  
Darby Hoover, Environmental Organization  
Jim Oddie, ACWMA  
Dave Sadoff, ACWMA  
Francisco Zermeño, ACWMA

**Absent:**

Tianna Nourot, Solid Waste Industry Representative  
Vacant, Source Reduction Specialist  
Vacant, Environmental Educator

**Staff Present:**

Wendy Sommer, Executive Director  
Jeff Becerra, Communications Manager  
Meghan Starkey, Senior Management Analyst  
Justin Lehrer, Senior Management Analyst  
Farand Kan, Deputy County Counsel  
Arliss Dunn, Clerk of the Board

**Others Participating:**

Richard Taylor, Authority Counsel  
Carolyn Bloede, Alameda County Generals Services Agency (GSA)  
Karen Cook, Alameda County Generals Services Agency (GSA)  
Sarah Church, Alameda County Generals Services Agency (GSA)

**III. ANNOUNCEMENTS BY THE PRESIDENT**

There were none.

**IV. OPEN PUBLIC COMMENT**

There was none.

## APPROVED

### V. CONSENT CALENDAR

1. **Approval of the Draft Minutes of December 12, 2019 (Jeff Becerra)**
2. **Board Attendance Record (Jeff Becerra)**
3. **Written Report of Ex Parte Communications (Jeff Becerra)**

There were no public comments for the consent calendar. Board member Carling made the motion to approve the consent calendar. Board member Zermeño seconded and the motion carried 8-0: (Ayes: Buckholz, Camara, Carling, Cox, Hoover, Oddie, Sadoff, Zermeño. Nays: None. Abstain: None. Absent: Nourot. Vacant: Source Reduction Specialist, Environmental Educator)

### VI. REGULAR CALENDAR

1. **Fiscal Year 2018-19 Audit Report (Pat Cabrera & Jennifer Luong)**

Staff recommends that the Recycling Board accept and file the FY 18-19 audit report.

Pat Cabrera presented an overview of the staff report and introduced Matesh Desai, Auditor, Badawi & Associates. Mr. Desai was available to answer any questions. Ms. Cabrera also recognized Jennifer Luong, Financial Services Manager, Nisha Patel, Management Analyst and the rest of the finance team, for their excellent work. Ms. Cabrera stated that the agency has a clean audit with no exceptions and no recommendations for improvements in internal controls and we are in a solid financial position. A link to the staff report is available here: [FY-2018-19--Audit-Report-01-09-20.pdf](#)

Board member Carling commended staff on a great job. President Cox concurred and stated that is reflected that the steps taken over the past year have been very effective.

There were no public comments on this item. Board member Sadoff made the motion that the Recycling Board accept and file the FY 18-19 audit report. Board member Zermeño seconded and the motion carried 8-0:

(Ayes: Buckholz, Camara, Carling, Cox, Hoover, Oddie, Sadoff, Zermeño. Nays: None. Abstain: None. Absent: Nourot. Vacant: Source Reduction Specialist, Environmental Educator)

2. **Municipal Panel-Alameda County Recycled Product Purchase Preference (RPPP) (Meghan Starkey)**

This item is for information only.

Meghan Starkey provided an overview of the staff report and introduced the panelists from Alameda County Generals Services Agency (GSA) Office of Sustainability: Carolyn Bloede, Karen Cook, and Sarah Church. The panelists provided a report on their leadership efforts in green purchasing.

An audio link to the presentation is available here: [Alameda-County-GSA-RPPP-Presentation-01-09-20](#)

A link to the PowerPoint presentation is available here: [GSA-RPPP-PowerPoint-Presentation-01-09-20.pdf](#)

President Cox thanked the panelists for their presentation.

## APPROVED

### 3. Countywide Element Update: Follow Up Discussion (Meghan Starkey)

Discuss the issues listed in the staff report and provide input to staff.

Meghan Starkey provided an overview of the staff report. A link to the report is available here: [CoIWMP-Followup-Discussion-01-09-20.pdf](#)

Board member Sadoff stated that the Castro Valley Sanitary District will be impacted by the fifteen mile rule and they would like to have a carbon footprint analysis and other formal evaluations conducted on this issue in the future. Board member Hoover stated that in addition to the review for assessing emissions and other environmental factors, she would like to also include information on the additional tons per mile that would be covered, where those additional reductions and expansions may occur, and which cities may take advantage of this. Mr. Taylor added we see this as something that would require very thoughtful analysis but it is not within the scope of the current update of the CoIWMP. However, we are flagging the issue as something that requires a more thorough analysis so that the Board has complete information. Board member Zermeño stated that Hayward staff doesn't see any need for changes to the fifteen mile rule at this time.

Board member Hoover reiterated her request to add generation rates along with the per capita rate. Ms. Starkey stated we are capturing that information from our member agencies. President Cox commented on the outreach campaigns with regard to the reusable bag ordinance and the public perception that they are doing the right thing by getting a heavier plastic bag from the retailer. President Cox recommended that the messaging focus on bringing their own bag. Board member Buckholz stated that she had read about the City of Berkeley's efforts to eliminate paper cups or charging for take-out cups, and she also heard about a company called Vessel that offered subscriptions for reusable cups. Justin Lehrer stated that we are working on the issue of reusable food ware and we will have a follow-up discussion at the January WMA meeting to discuss the options for a model or countywide ordinance. Mr. Lehrer added we are carefully watching the City of Berkeley as well, and the Vessel program is a pilot project with approximately nine restaurants participating in the program. Mr. Lehrer added the key issue is to try and develop infrastructure for reusable food ware in the to-go sector. Board member Oddie stated that he as well as other Board members have received inquiries from the press and he is amazed at the interest in this issue. Board member Zermeño recently appeared on Telemundo regarding this issue.

County Counsel Farand Kan provided a response regarding the use of the agency property for the development of a compost or recycling facility. Mr. Kan stated that the other "Measure D" that provides a description of Land Use Designations and allowable uses as specified under the East County Area plan allows that the land could possibly be used for developing a composting facility but not likely for a recycling facility. Ms. Sommer stated that we currently have enough composting capacity in county. WMA Legal Counsel Richard Taylor provided a response regarding the conformance finding process and whether the WMA Board could adopt an ordinance requiring the cities to notify the agency in the initial stages of submitting environmental documents for a solid waste project within the county. Mr. Taylor stated that as he advised the P&A Committee, the WMA had the legal authority to do so. He noted that enforcement might be challenging from a practical standpoint and suggested that an alternative approach would be to focus on solidifying staff relationships through the Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) or other means to demonstrate the benefit of having the knowledge and expertise that the WMA could provide for their particular project.

Ms. Starkey stated that the next steps will be to provide a summary of the goals and policies from the Board discussions and stakeholder input and we hope to bring the full document to the WMA Board for a first reading in March or April.

## **APPROVED**

### **VII. COMMUNICATIONS/MEMBER COMMENTS**

Wendy Sommer announced that StopWaste recently earned a 2-Star rating from Fitwel, the leading certification system for buildings designed and operated to support occupant health and well-being. This is a significant award as StopWaste is the first public agency to receive certification.

Board member Oddie inquired about the two vacancies on the Recycling Board. Mr. Becerra stated that technically we have three vacancies. Board member Camara has graciously agreed to continue to serve in the category of Recycling Materials Processing Industry until a successor is appointed. Mr. Becerra added we are working with Supervisor Keith Carson's office to fill the vacancies and hope to have them filled within the coming months.

### **VIII. ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 4:56 p.m.