

APPROVED

**MINUTES OF REGULAR MEETING OF THE
PLANNING COMMITTEE
AND
ALAMEDA COUNTY RECYCLING BOARD**

Thursday, May 9, 2019

7:00 P.M.

**Castro Valley Library
3600 Norbridge Avenue
Castro Valley, CA 94546
510-667-7900**

I. CALL TO ORDER

President Sarah Vared called the meeting to order at 7:02 p.m.

II. ROLL CALL OF ATTENDANCE

Jillian Buckholz, Recycling Programs
Bernie Camara, Recycling Materials Processing Industry
Deborah Cox, ACWMA
Nancy Deming, Environmental Educator
Dianne Martinez, ACWMA
Jim Oddie, ACWMA
Dave Sadoff, ACWMA
Sarah Vared, Source Reduction Specialist
Francisco Zermeño, ACWMA

Absent:

Tianna Nourot, Solid Waste Industry Representative
Vacant, Environmental Organization

Staff Present:

Wendy Sommer, Executive Director
Jeff Becerra, Communications Manager
Anu Natarajan, Legislative and Regulatory Affairs Manager
Justin Lehrer, Senior Management Analyst
Michelle Fay, Program Manager
Farand Kan, County Counsel
Arliss Dunn, Clerk of the Board

Others Participating:

Arthur Boone

III. ANNOUNCEMENTS BY PRESIDENT

There were none.

APPROVED

IV. OPEN PUBLIC COMMENT

Arthur Boone provided public comment regarding his discussions with some members of the original Measure D committee regarding the possibility of filing an amicus brief in response to the dissatisfaction with the results of the decision that the agency made regarding the permitting of the mixed waste processing facility at the Davis Street Transfer Station. He noted that there has been dissatisfaction with some other decisions that the Recycling Board has made over the last thirty years.

V. CONSENT CALENDAR

1. **Approval of the Draft Joint Minutes of April 24, 2019 (Jeff Becerra)**
2. **Board Attendance Record (Jeff Becerra)**
3. **Written Report of Ex Parte Communications (Jeff Becerra)**
4. **Grants Issued Under Executive Director Signature Authority (Wendy Sommer)**

There were no public comments for the consent calendar. Board member Buckholz made the motion to approve the consent calendar. Board member Zermeño seconded and the motion carried 7-0: (Ayes: Buckholz, Camara, Cox, Deming, Sadoff, Vared, Zermeño. Nays: None. Abstain: Martinez. Absent: Nourot, Oddie. Vacant: Environmental Organization)

VI. REGULAR CALENDAR

1. **Background for Single-Use Disposable Foodware Ordinance (Anu Natarajan)**

This item is for information only.

Anu Natarajan provided an overview of the staff report and presented a PowerPoint presentation. A link to the combined report and presentation is available here: [SUDS-Compostables-Presentation-05-09-19.pdf](#). Justin Lehrer shared samples of single use food ware product types as well as compostable food service ware collected from composting facilities.

Board member Martinez inquired about how consumers would know if food service ware items are poly-lined or contain toxic additives. Mr. Lehrer stated that consumers would not know if the item contains either unless the manufacturer provides the information and this is typically not disclosed. Mr. Lehrer added it may be helpful that the BPI (Biodegradable Products Institute) certification is changing and might no longer certify products with perfluorinated compounds (PFAs, PFOAs). Board member Deming stated that OUSD (Oakland Unified School District) has their products tested at the Center for Environmental Health located in Oakland. Board member Sadoff inquired about the acronyms OMRI and NOP. Mr. Lehrer replied that OMRI is the Organics Materials Review Institute, an international non-profit that determines which input products are allowed for use in organic production and processing. OMRI Listed products that are allowed for use in certified organic operations under the USDA National Organic Program. NOP is the National Organic Program that was created to establish organic standards, and to require and oversee mandatory certification of organic production. Board member Martinez commented that she recently toured the Davis Street Transfer Station and noted that the compost is turned over very quickly and doesn't allow sufficient time for the compostable food ware to degrade and added these facilities will likely not accept these items. Mr. Lehrer stated that once the composting process is completed there is a screening that occurs and any materials that do not pass through the screens are typically landfilled. Board member Sadoff inquired

APPROVED

if a cost benefit analysis has been done to determine if it is more beneficial to landfill with regard to emissions that are captured.

Ms. Natarajan stated that she is not sure but staff will be looking at the cost benefit analysis as well as the environmental impacts of traveling to the landfill after processing at composting facilities versus going directly to landfill, and also the life cycle analysis of products. Ms. Sommer clarified that we are talking about the effects of single use compostable food ware as opposed to leaves and grass clippings. Board member Zermeño stated he supports the direction of the agency and inquired about the timeline for the model ordinance. Ms. Natarajan stated that staff will come to the WMA Board in October for a discussion regarding the timeline for the EIR and to discuss other analyses that need to be done. We hope to have a draft baseline ordinance before the Board between June and September of 2020.

Board member Zermeño inquired about how soon we can begin spreading the waste prevention messaging. Ms. Sommer stated we can begin the waste prevention messaging immediately, e.g. straws upon request. However, before we make an official mandate and to not lose credibility, we want to do further analysis to assure the public that the materials are being properly managed. Board member Zermeño inquired with respect to packaging if the agency has any connections to Amazon. Mr. Lehrer stated that we worked with staff from Amazon last year to study life cycle impacts of several Amazon packaging formats. The contact has since left Amazon and we are looking to reestablish a connection. Board member Buckholz stated that Cal State East Bay messaging is when in doubt, throw it out and inquired if this the agency ascribed to this messaging. Mr. Becerra stated that one of our haulers uses this messaging but the agency prefers to message “when in doubt, find out.” President Vared commented that StopWaste has limited resources with respect to such a massive problem and inquired if staff has considered in which areas we could receive the most bang for our buck. Ms. Sommer stated that during the agency’s Priority Setting session, the Board designated single-use food ware as an area of priority. Also, the cities of Alameda and Berkeley adopted a single use food ware ordinance. Board member Oddie stated that he attended an event where they were using metal tableware and recalls that five years ago the state was in a drought and there were regulations on water use and inquired if we may reverse that decision. Ms. Sommer stated that there was a study that looked at using real dishes versus single use food ware and using water seemed okay. We can follow-up with the Board regarding the study. Board member Martinez asked that the cities of Alameda and Berkeley provide a presentation to the Board on enforcement efforts after the ordinances have been in effect over time. President Vared thanked staff for the presentation.

2. New Training Videos for Businesses (Michelle Fay)

This item is for information only.

Michelle Fay provided a brief summary of the staff report and presented a PowerPoint presentation. A link to the report and the presentation is available here: [MRO-Video-Presentation-05-09-19.pdf](#). A link to the training videos is available here: www.RecyclingRulesAC.org/resources.

Board member Deming commended staff on a great job and stated that the videos will prove extremely helpful when training kitchen staff. Board member Deming noted that at the end of the video it showed aseptic containers going to landfill and shredded paper into organics. Ms. Fay replied that it was challenging creating videos for countywide use with 17 different franchises so the videos represent what the majority of franchises are doing. Additionally, the rules are different for certain materials for schools and businesses as opposed to residents. President Vared thanked Ms. Fay for the presentation.

APPROVED

VII. COMMUNICATIONS/MEMBER COMMENTS

Board member Sadoff announced that the Castro Valley Sanitary District started a new contract with ACI on May 1 and so far it is working out very well. The hauler rolled out a new brochure in conjunction with the contract and it is very useful. Board member Martinez stated that she heard that the City of Richmond hauler is able to assess a fee on residential customers for contamination and inquired how it is going. Mr. Becerra stated that California Waste Solutions (City of Oakland recycling hauler) is assessing a fee as well for contamination found in the recycling bin. Ms. Sommer stated that Waste Management is installing cameras in their trucks as well. Board member Deming announced that she will be moving out of Alameda County and will no longer serve on the Recycling Board. She expressed her appreciation for serving on the Recycling Board. The Board and staff thanked her for her service.

VIII. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 8:17 p.m.