

APPROVED

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING
OF THE
ALAMEDA COUNTY WASTE MANAGEMENT AUTHORITY (WMA)**

**And
THE ENERGY COUNCIL (EC)**

Wednesday, February 22, 2017

3:00 P.M.

**StopWaste Offices
1537 Webster Street
Oakland, CA 94612
510-891-6500**

I. CALL TO ORDER

Dan Kalb, President, WMA, called the meeting to order at 3.02 p.m.

II. ROLL CALL

WMA & EC:

County of Alameda	Keith Carson, WMA, EC
City of Alameda	Jim Oddie, WMA, EC
City of Albany	Peter Maass, WMA, EC
Castro Valley Sanitary District	Dave Sadoff, WMA
City of Dublin	Don Biddle, WMA, EC
City of Emeryville	Dianne Martinez, WMA, EC
City of Hayward	Sara Lamnin, WMA, EC
City of Livermore	Bob Carling, WMA, EC
City of Newark	Mike Hannon, WMA, EC
City of Oakland	Dan Kalb, WMA, EC
Oro Loma Sanitary District	Shelia Young, WMA
City of Piedmont	Tim Rood, WMA, EC
City of Pleasanton	Kathy Narum, WMA, EC
City of San Leandro	Deborah Cox, WMA, EC

ABSENT:

City of Berkeley	Jesse Arreguin, WMA, EC
City of Fremont	Vinnie Bacon, WMA, EC
City of Union City	Lorin Ellis, WMA, EC

Staff Participating:

Wendy Sommer, Executive Director
Tom Padia, Deputy Executive Director
Pat Cabrera, Administrative Services Director
Debra Kaufman, Senior Program Manager
Richard Taylor, Legal Counsel, Authority Board
Arliss Dunn, Clerk of the Board

APPROVED

Others Present:

Shawn Tackitt, Waste Management, Inc.

Peter Slote, City of Oakland

Antoinette Stein, City of Berkeley resident

Jim Prola, City of San Leandro resident/prior Council member/Vice Mayor

Wafaa Aborashed, Bay Area Health Communities and City of San Leandro resident

Arthur Boone, NCRA

III. ANNOUNCEMENTS BY THE PRESIDENTS

Wendy Sommer welcomed Councilmember Sara Lamnin to the WMA Board as the new representative for the City of Hayward. Arthur Boone announced that Gretchen Brewer, a pioneer in the recycling movement had recently passed away. Ken Bukowski announced that he had recorded a forum at Oakland City Hall regarding public banks and encouraged local cities to consider exploring public banks.

IV. CONSENT CALENDAR

1. **Approval of the Draft Minutes of January 25, 2017 (Wendy Sommer)** **Action**
2. **Waste Characterization 2017: Contractor Recommendation (Meghan Starkey)** **Action**
The Programs & Administration Committee recommends that the Authority Board authorize the Executive Director to enter into a contract with SCS Engineers for a total of \$347,000.

Board member Young made the motion to approve the Consent calendar. Board member Narum seconded and the motion carried 16-0. (Cox-absent from room)

(Ayes: Biddle, Carling, Carson, Hannon, Kalb, Lamnin, Maass, Martinez, Narum, Oddie, Rood, Sadoff, Young. Nays: None. Abstain: None. Absent: Arreguin, Bacon, Ellis).

V. OPEN PUBLIC DISCUSSION

There was none.

VI. REGULAR CALENDAR

1. **First Reading and Public Hearing for Ordinance 2017-02: Amendment to the Alameda County Integrated Waste Management Plan to Include the Davis Street Transfer Station Organics Facilities in the City of San Leandro (Debra Kaufman)** **Action**

Staff and the Recycling Board as LTF and the P&O committee, recommend that the WMA Board take the following actions:

Hold a public hearing and introduce and waive the first reading of the ColWMP Amendment ordinance (Attachment A) at the February 22, 2017 meeting to:

1. Amend the ColWMP (Exhibit 1) to include the Davis Street Organics Facilities at the Davis Street Transfer Station in San Leandro, and make additional changes for consistency;
2. Find that the Davis Street Organics Facilities including the organics materials recovery facility (OMRF), composting facility and anaerobic digestion facility conform to the ColWMP as amended and;
3. Make the findings required by CEQA, and also recommend that the Authority Board direct staff to place the ordinance on the calendar for adoption at the March 22, 2017 meeting.

APPROVED

Debra Kaufman provided a summary of the staff report. The report is available here:

[Davis-Street-CoIWMP-memo.pdf](#)

Shawn Tackitt, Project Manager, Waste Management, Inc. provided an overview of the proposed OMRF project. Prior to public comments Board member Martinez requested that staff clarify if the role of the Board is to weigh the merits or weaknesses of the project or are they limited to specific findings given the project has undergone the necessary CEQA requirements. Ms. Kaufman responded that the role of the WMA Board is to make sure that the project is consistent with the policies and siting criteria contained within the CoIWMP and to review the CEQA that was done by the lead agency. Board member Martinez inquired about the appropriate venue for anyone expressing concerns related to the merits or other issues relating to the project. Ms. Kaufman stated that the project is still under review for air permitting through BAAQMD and CalRecycle has to issue a permit as well.

President Kalb opened the public hearing. Peter Slote, City of Oakland, provided context and intent of the City of Oakland's involvement in the project. Toni Stein, Environmental Health Trust, expressed concern regarding environmental justice and equity issues around the corridor of the Davis Street facility with respect to the odors and particulates that may exist from the proposed facility. Ms. Stein asked that the Board not approve the project. Jim Prola, San Leandro resident, former Councilmember and Vice Mayor, commented that he worked closely with Waste Management via a neighborhood forum. Mr. Prola stated that initially Waste Management was not responsive to neighborhood complaints but has become extremely responsive to resolving any issues. He added there have been minimal complaints over the past years. Wafaa Aborashed, Bay Area Health Communities and San Leandro resident, expressed concern regarding increased pollution and truck traffic from the proposed facility. Arthur Boone commented on the merits of source separation and expressed doubt about the viability of the proposed facility. There were no further public speakers. President Kalb closed the public hearing.

Board member Sadoff inquired about the rationale for the proposed reduction in truck traffic. Mr. Tackitt stated that the decomposition in the composting and digestion processes reduces the volume of solids and much of the moisture in food will be evaporated, therefore reducing the volume of loads. The number of outbound trucks will be reduced by between 6-10 trucks per day. There will be no reduction in the number of inbound trucks (it's the same amount as current traffic). Board member Sadoff inquired if the BAAQMD will require perimeter monitoring at the facility and if not Waste Management may want to institute the program to allay any neighborhood concerns. Mr. Tackitt stated they might look into it. The project is required to meet the BAAQMD emissions monitoring requirements. Board member Lamnin inquired if solar will be installed onsite. Mr. Tackitt stated yes solar will be installed on the proposed facility as well as other buildings at the Davis Street site. Board member Lamnin inquired if the facility is constructed considering future capacity as well as to accommodate current capacity. Mr. Tackitt stated yes. Board member Maass inquired about existing studies about facilities in other countries that have used this technology and its effectiveness. Mr. Tackitt stated that Waste Management is partnering with equipment vendors and operators experienced in this field as well as a specific company that operates 40 facilities and processes over 7.5 million tons per year. Board member Maass added he is concerned that the public will learn about this process and will stop separating materials. Mr. Tackitt stated that the facility is designated to process municipal waste after source separation and Waste Management has been very careful in not publicizing the facility.

Board member Martinez asked for clarification regarding the alleged discrepancies between the 2010 Initial Study and Negative Declaration and the description of the current project. Mr. Tackitt stated that the facility proposed in San Leandro as described in the master plan is identical to the description in the CEQA document and has the following components: materials separation from MSW, anaerobic digestion, and composting. Board member Young inquired about the categories of the 100 new union jobs that will be created. Mr. Tackitt stated that the new jobs will be in the operator and maintenance categories. Board member Cox stated that as

APPROVED

the representative for San Leandro she is aware of the concerns but she has toured the facility and spoke with city staff regarding the project and she is pleased to know that the facility is self-contained and is assured that Waste Management is committed to resolving any issues that may arise. She is also pleased to know that there will be no increase in out bound truck traffic. Board member Cox noted that Oyster Bay Regional Park is adjoined to the Davis Street Transfer Station and Waste Management has been working with East Bay Regional Parks for landscaping improvements in the renovation of Oyster Bay. Mr. Tackitt added East Bay Regional Parks is also assisting them with a grant from CalRecycle. Board member Hannon stated that the comments from Board member Cox were important as the representative for San Leandro. Board member Hannon inquired about the status of the application for a solid waste permit and inquired about any current violations. Mr. Tackitt stated with respect to the solid waste permit they are waiting on the results from Board action on the ColWMP hearing and added there aren't any current violations. Board member Hannon inquired if they are able to store green waste uncovered. Mr. Tackitt stated in 2013 they constructed a green waste building under a master plan and all of the green waste was moved indoors. Board member Hannon stated that he is excited about the new technology and is looking forward to having a status update when the facility is in operation. Ms. Sommer stated that staff will arrange a tour for the Board when the facility is in operation. Mr. Tackitt stated that the organics portion of the OMRF will begin in March 2018 and compost operations will commence in either late 2018 or early 2019. President Kalb concurred with Board member Hannon that the Board would like to have an analysis on the success of the OMRF a year after operations have commenced. Board member Sadoff inquired of staff if there is a way to evaluate current conditions as far as the amount of source separated organics that are currently coming in from Oakland a year out. Peter Slote stated that all of the materials are moving targets. The amount of organics varies by the drought and production of plant debris. However there will be a way to assess the success of the OMRF but not year by year tonnage numbers. Tom Padia added that most of what the cities have in terms of source separation are reports from their haulers and we request copies of that data. However, precipitation patterns create a significant fluctuation in the amount of green cart contents. We have pretty good numbers from our benchmark program and we can continue to evaluate that data and note any increase in single family organics in the garbage.

Board member Cox made the motion to hold a public hearing and introduce and waive the first reading of the ColWMP Amendment ordinance (Attachment A) to: 1) Amend the ColWMP (Exhibit 1) to include the Davis Street Organics Facilities at the Davis Street Transfer Station in San Leandro, and make additional changes for consistency; 2) Find that the Davis Street Organics Facilities including the organics materials recovery facility (OMRF), composting facility and anaerobic digestion facility conform to the ColWMP as amended and; 3) Make the findings required by CEQA, and also recommend that the Authority Board direct staff to place the ordinance on the calendar for adoption at the March 22, 2017 meeting. The Board added a request to Waste Management to provide analysis and an update to the Board a year after the facility commences operating. Board member Biddle seconded and the motion carried 17-0.

(Ayes: Biddle, Carling, Carson, Cox, Hannon, Kalb, Lamnin, Maass, Martinez, Oddie, Narum, Rood, Sadoff, Young. Nays: None. Abstain: None. Absent: Arreguin, Bacon, Ellis).

- | 2. Workforce Strategy: Two-Year Service Credit (Pat Cabrera) | Action |
|--|---------------|
| Staff recommends that the WMA Board approve offering the two-year service credit to eligible employees in the Program Manager I, Program Manager II and Senior Program Manager classifications, and approve establishing the window period to begin May 1, 2017 and end September 30, 2017. Staff further recommends that the Board direct the Executive Director or designee to prepare the enacting resolution for action at the March 22, 2017 WMA Board meeting. | |

Pat Cabrera provided a summary of the staff report. The report is available here:

[Two-Year-Service-Credit-memo.pdf](#)

APPROVED

Board member Hannon stated that he is concerned about offering the incentive to employees that have been employed by the agency for only five years and inquired about the average tenure of the three employees that has accepted the offer. Ms. Cabrera stated the five year vesting requirement is established by PERS but the average tenure for the employees that have accepted the offer is fourteen years. Board member Carling inquired how staff perceived the offer - was it positively received by staff? Ms. Sommer stated that she received positive comments regarding Board direction to move forward. Ms. Cabrera added that individual meetings were held with eligible employees who expressed that they did not feel pressured to accept the offer and were appreciative of Board approval of offering the incentive. Board member Lamnin inquired about the effects of our long term liability. Ms. Cabrera stated that the long term liability will be factored in and will be part of the discussion once we know the actual number of employees that will participate in the incentive. Board member Hannon asked that the budget document include a note outlining the anticipated salary savings referencing this action. Ms. Cabrera stated that she will include a note in the annual fiscal forecast. There was no public comment on this item.

Board member Hannon made the motion to approve the staff recommendation. Board member Narum seconded and the motion carried 17-0.

(Ayes: Biddle, Carling, Carson, Cox, Hannon, Kalb, Lamnin, Maass, Martinez, Narum, Oddie, Rood, Sadoff, Young. Nays: None. Abstain: None. Absent: Arreguin, Bacon, Ellis.

Ms. Sommer requested direction from the Board for structuring the meeting in March as the agenda will include the Business Efficiency Awards event. The Board directed staff to hold the Board meeting first at the normal 3:00 start time with the event to follow.

Ms. Sommer announced the award recipients:

Evergreen Nursery, San Leandro

Niles Pie Company, Union City

Rahma Mediterranean Market, Dublin

Guckenheimer Corporate Food Service, with projects in Fremont, Newark, Dublin, Pleasanton, Livermore and Alameda

Beneficial State Bank, Oakland

- 3. Interim appointment(s) to the Recycling Board for WMA appointee unable to attend future Board Meeting(s) (Wendy Sommer) Action**
(P&O and Recycling Board meeting, March 9, 2017 - 4:00 pm – StopWaste Offices, 1537 Webster Street, Oakland, CA)

There were no requests for an interim appointment.

VII. COMMUNICATION/MEMBER COMMENTS

Information

There were none.

VIII. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 4:27 p.m.