

**APPROVED**  
**MINUTES OF THE MEETING**  
**OF THE**  
**ALAMEDA COUNTY WASTE MANAGEMENT AUTHORITY (WMA)**  
**AND**  
**THE ENERGY COUNCIL (EC)**

**Wednesday, December 20, 2017**

**3:00 P.M.**

**StopWaste Offices**  
**1537 Webster Street**  
**Oakland, CA 94612**  
**510-891-6500**

**I. CALL TO ORDER**

President Mike Hannon, WMA, called the meeting to order at 3:02 p.m.

**II. ROLL CALL OF ATTENDANCE**

**WMA & EC:**

City of Alameda	Jim Oddie, WMA, EC
City of Albany	Peter Maass, WMA, EC
City of Berkeley	Jesse Arreguin, WMA, EC
Castro Valley Sanitary District	Dave Sadoff, WMA
City of Dublin	Don Biddle, WMA, EC
City of Emeryville	Dianne Martinez, WMA, EC
City of Fremont	David Bonaccorsi, WMA, EC
City of Hayward	Sara Lamnin, WMA, EC
City of Livermore	Bob Carling, WMA, EC
City of Oakland	Dan Kalb, WMA, EC
Oro Loma Sanitary District	Shelia Young, WMA
City of Piedmont	Tim Rood, WMA, EC
City of Newark	Mike Hannon, WMA, EC
City of Union City	Lorin Ellis, WMA, EC

**ABSENT:**

County of Alameda	Keith Carson, WMA, EC
City of Pleasanton	Jerry Pentin, WMA, EC
City of San Leandro	Deborah Cox, WMA, EC

**Staff Participating:**

Wendy Sommer, Executive Director  
Tom Padia, Deputy Executive Director  
Karen Kho, Senior Program Manager  
Jennifer West, Program Manager  
Richard Taylor, WMA Legal Counsel  
Arliss Dunn, Clerk of the Board

**Others Participating:**

Rachel DiFranco, City of Fremont

## APPROVED

### III. ANNOUNCEMENTS BY PRESIDENTS

There were none.

### IV. OPEN PUBLIC DISCUSSION FROM THE FLOOR

There was none.

### V. CONSENT CALENDAR

#### 1. Approval of the Draft Minutes of November 15, 2017 (Wendy Sommer)

There was no public comment for Item #V.1 of the Consent Calendar. Board member Maass made the motion to approve Item #V.1 of the Consent Calendar. Board member Rood seconded and the motion carried 15-0: (Ayes: Arreguin, Biddle, Bonaccorsi, Carling, Hannon, Kalb, Lamnin, Maass, Martinez, Oddie, Rood, Sadoff, Young. Nays: None. Abstain: None. Absent: Carson, Cox, Ellis, Pentin).

#### 2. Changes to Energy Council Rules of Procedure (Wendy Sommer)

That the Board adopt the revisions to the Energy Council Board Rules of Procedure.

Board member Lamnin requested that Item #V.2 of the Consent Calendar be removed for further discussion. Executive Director Wendy Sommer stated that in September, the WMA Board approved changes to its Rules of Procedure and staff revised the Energy Council's Rules of Procedure to ensure consistency with the recently updated Waste Management Authority Rules of Procedure. Board member Lamnin requested that staff ensure that the language in Section 3:8 and 5:8 are consistent regarding Board members who are unable to attend a meeting in person are encouraged to have their member agency's alternate attend in their place.

There was no public comment on this item. Board member Lamnin made the motion to adopt the revisions to the Energy Council Board Rules of Procedure with the aforementioned revision. Board member Rood seconded and the motion carried 15-0: (Ayes: Arreguin, Biddle, Bonaccorsi, Carling, Hannon, Kalb, Lamnin, Maass, Martinez, Oddie, Rood. Nays: None. Abstain: None. Absent: Carson, Cox, Ellis, Pentin).

### VI. REGULAR CALENDAR

#### 1. Vacancy on the Recycling Board (Arliss Dunn)

Staff recommends that the WMA Board fill the upcoming vacancy on the Recycling Board.

The Clerk of the Board informed the Executive Director that Board member Pentin would be completing his second term on the Recycling Board on January 19, 2018 thereby creating a vacancy on the Recycling Board. The WMA Board will need to appoint a WMA representative to the Recycling Board. Mr. Padia added Board member Pentin will attend the January 2018 Recycling Board member so the new representative would not begin their term until the February meeting. There was no public comment on this item.

Board member Young made the motion to nominate Board member Lamnin (Hayward) to fill the upcoming vacancy on the Recycling Board. Board member Lamnin accepted the nomination. Board member Rood seconded and the motion carried 15-0: (Ayes: Arreguin, Biddle, Bonaccorsi, Carling, Hannon, Kalb, Lamnin, Maass, Martinez, Oddie, Rood, Sadoff, Young. Nays: None. Abstain: None. Absent: Carson, Cox, Ellis, Pentin).

#### 2. 2018 Meeting Schedule (Arliss Dunn)

It is recommended that the WMA/EC, P&A Committee, and the Recycling Board/Planning Committee, each adopt their respective regular meeting schedules for 2018.

## APPROVED

There was no public comment on this item. Board member Carling made the motion to adopt the WMA/EC 2018 meeting schedule. Board member Arreguin seconded and the motion carried 15-0: (Ayes: Arreguin, Biddle, Bonaccorsi, Carling, Hannon, Kalb, Lamnin, Maass, Martinez, Oddie, Rood, Sadoff, Young. Nays: None. Abstain: None. Absent: Carson, Cox, Ellis, Pentin).

### **3. Interim appointment(s) to the Recycling Board for WMA appointee unable to attend future Board Meeting(s) (Wendy Sommer)**

(Planning Committee and Recycling Board meeting, January 11, 2018 at 4:00 pm, StopWaste Offices, 1537 Webster Street, Oakland, CA)

There were no requests for an interim appointment.

EC President Dianne Martinez chaired the EC items agenda items. Board member Ellis arrived prior to the EC agenda items.

### **4. 2018 BayREN Contract (Karen Kho) (EC Only)**

Adopt the attached Resolution authorizing the Executive Director to enter into a 2018 contract with ABAG for Bay Area Regional Energy Network (BayREN) services and other related actions.

Karen Kho provided an overview of the staff report. A link to the report is available here: [2018-BayREN-Contract-12-20-17.pdf](#)

Board member Rood inquired about how the Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC) and ABAG merger might affect the contract. Ms. Kho stated that there have already been some changes with regard to administration and this contract has gone through the MTC legal process. The BayREN member contracts are now going to the Executive Board for approval. Ms. Kho added an additional programmatic change is the "Pay As You Save" finance program is planning to use ABAG's reinvigorated financing authority. Board member Rood inquired if there has been any discussion regarding the future of BayREN as it relates to East Bay Community Energy. Ms. Kho stated yes, BayREN and ABAG have been very active in meeting with all of the CCAs that have been forming in the various counties to see how BayREN can be supportive and to ensure there isn't any duplication of programs. There are unique opportunities for BayREN to run different types of programs from CCAs and utilities since it is not held to the same cost effectiveness standards. These programs would be complementary for a CCA.

Board member Lamnin stated that some of the programs are well balanced in terms of distribution of impact across the county and inquired if there is thought about balancing it out moving forward. Ms. Kho stated that staff works closely with the Technical Advisory Group TAG to ensure coverage throughout the county when doing outreach events and to increase contractor participation in areas where there is smaller uptake. However, since the program is market based, predicting participation can be difficult. There was no public comment on this item.

Board member Rood made the motion to approve the staff recommendation. Board member Kalb seconded and the motion carried 16-0: (Ayes: Arreguin, Biddle, Bonaccorsi, Carling, Ellis, Hannon, Kalb, Lamnin, Maass, Martinez, Oddie, Rood. Nays: None. Abstain: None. Absent: Carson, Cox, Pentin).

### **5. East Bay Energy Watch Policy Paper (Jennifer West) (EC Only)**

This item is for information only.

Jennifer West provided an overview of the staff report and introduced Rachel DiFranco, City of Fremont. Ms. DiFranco presented a PowerPoint presentation on "Navigating the Changing Landscape of Energy Efficiency Programs in the East Bay." A link to the staff report and the presentation is available here: [EC-EBEW-Policy-Paper-Presentation-12-20-17.pdf](#)

## APPROVED

President Hannon commented that not all cities in Alameda County are participating in the CCAs and we wouldn't want to inadvertently exclude communities that might benefit from energy efficiency programs. Board member Maass commented that it would be helpful to include information on the size, cost, successes and effectiveness of these programs as the rate funded programs must show energy efficiency and inquired if there is any sense of programs that are not prescribed to do that. Board member Maass added that ultimately decisions about where we are going forward will not be made at the local level but on the state level. Ms. DiFranco stated that when it comes to how East Bay Community Energy decides to do energy efficiency programs there is a significant role staff and local elected officials can play in terms of providing insight and guidance. Ms. DiFranco added in terms of going to PUC level and looking at cost effectiveness analysis and how they currently evaluate programs that are being delivered through rate payer dollars, it is a broader discussion. There is some discussion taking place currently around whether we are evaluating programs in a way that isn't effective and if we should be evaluating programs on carbon reduction versus kilowatt hours or therms of energy saved. Ms. West added they wanted to add program metrics to the paper, but it was difficult to get metrics from PG&E for the two-county territory and staff did not want to include an unbalanced picture.

Board member Bonaccorsi expressed concern on PG&E's approach to some of the jurisdictional issues with the CCAs, especially issues or conflicts that are data driven or renewable energy driven.

Ms. Sommer stated that at the heart of the issue is coordination, and stated that some of the Energy Council Board members also sit on the EBCE Board, and staff is hopeful that they will convey the information on what is available in energy efficiency programs, highlight the work that StopWaste is doing, and how we can work together to move forward. Ms. Sommer added that the agency recently received a letter from the Mayor of Albany seeking our support for an application for a grant from the CEC for energy efficiency programs to be conducted by EBCE and city staff and StopWaste staff were unaware of the issue. Ms. Sommer stressed the importance of the need for coordination to ensure that we are not getting in each other's ways. Board member Lamnin commented that she is pleased to see the effort toward coordination and recommended forming a working group comprised of staff from the various energy efficiency groups to create one intake hub in order to triage information systematically to the public. Ms. West commented on the changing landscape of PG&E's energy efficiency programs. Ms. West stated that over the next two to four years, PG&E will be required to outsource third-party-60% of energy efficiency portfolio and we are not sure what that will mean for the East Bay Energy Watch. Board member Rood inquired as to why they are required to outsource that percentage. Ms. West stated that the decision was made by the CPUC and she thinks it may involve letting go of PG&E oversight of designing and implementing programs. There was no public comment on this item. President Martinez thanked Ms. West and Ms. DiFranco for their presentation and discussion.

### VII. COMMUNICATION/MEMBER COMMENTS

Ms. Sommer distributed a copy of the monthly topic brief on our stop food waste campaign "Stop Food Waste at Home." The topic brief is also available on the StopWaste website at this link:

[Stop-Food-Waste-At-Home-Topic-Brief](#). Ms. Sommer introduced the newest staff members: Ben Cooper, Energy Program Manager, and Anu Natarajan, Legislative and Regulatory Affairs Manager. Board member Oddie requested that staff email to him a copy of the topic brief to include on the Council agenda. President Hannon thanked the Board and staff for a wonderful year.

### VIII. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 3:47 p.m.