



---

**DATE:** March 10, 2016

**TO:** Programs and Administration Committee

**FROM:** Wendy Sommer, Executive Director

**BY:** Pat Cabrera, Administrative Services Director

**SUBJECT:** Mandatory Recycling Ordinance - Site Inspector Analysis

---

**SUMMARY**

In October 2015, the WMA Board based on the recommendation of the Programs and Administration (P&A) Committee directed staff to conduct an analysis as to the feasibility of hiring Agency employees to perform Mandatory Recycling Ordinance Implementation (MRO) site inspections compared to the current use of contract positions. At the March P&A meeting staff will discuss the results of this analysis and recommend continuing with contract positions at this juncture.

**DISCUSSION**

At the October 18, 2015 WMA Board Meeting, the Board approved the recommendation from the P&A committee for staff to conduct an analysis regarding the feasibility of hiring Agency employees to conduct MRO site inspections as opposed to the current use of contract positions. The staff report discussing this issue can be found at [Total Compensation Study](#). Staff engaged the service of Koff & Associates (who have performed past compensation and classification analysis for the Agency) to perform this assessment. The results of their study are attached.

As part of the study Koff & Associates interviewed key staff from the MRO program including Deputy Director Tom Padia and Senior Program Manager Brian Mathews. In addition, Koff & Associates provided and analyzed a detailed position description questionnaire in order to determine a classification specification. Based on that information a job description for a Site Inspector was developed. As further indicated in the report the consultant conducted a market compensation study for similar positions and determined that meter readers and parking enforcement officers were similar in job duties and minimum qualifications.

Based on these findings and using just the median monthly compensation for this class, the compensation cost (salary plus benefits) for an inspector would be approximately \$100,000 per year. This does not include projected salary increases or increased cost for benefits, nor does it include the costs for training, transportation, insurance, etc. which we conservatively estimate would total at least an additional \$20,000 per inspector per year. The current contract for three inspectors is \$320,000. Therefore, the equivalent cost of three in-house positions would be at least \$360,000 per year. This does not include one-time costs for furniture and equipment that would range from \$15,000 - \$20,000. Furthermore, as the MRO program is just now entering the enforcement stage for Phase 2 and just recently began issuing initial citations for Phase 1, it is not yet an appropriate time to evaluate long term staffing needs for enforcement. Oakland and Fremont, the two largest cities in the county, have not yet implemented the Phase 2 addition of organics, and we will not have a full year of countywide enforcement experience under the full ordinance until the end of 2018. That is about when we could expect to have better metrics and indicators of ordinance effectiveness at reducing “good stuff in the garbage” and also when we might expect to have experienced some reduction of current staffing levels due to attrition. For all of these reasons (better basis for forecasting long term enforcement workload, better grasp of ordinance effectiveness as currently written and implemented, and greater chance of having somewhere to put new staff), approximately three years from now would seem the most opportune time to revisit the issue of converting contract inspectors to in-house positions.

## **RECOMMENDATION**

Staff recommends that the P&A Committee recommend to the WMA Board that staff continue engaging contracted services for MRO site inspections.

Attachment: Koff & Associates report with job description and market data

To: Pat Cabrera, Administrative Services Director  
From: Katie Kaneko, Project Manager  
Date: February 23, 2016  
RE: Classification Study – Recycling Site Inspectors

---

In December 2015, the Alameda County Waste Management Authority (Stopwaste) contracted with Koff & Associates (K&A) to conduct a classification and compensation study review of the contract positions performing recycling site inspections. Stopwaste desired a review of the positions to capture the duties and responsibilities within a classification description and to survey the market for comparable bodies of work to determine whether it was feasible to convert the contract positions to Authority employees.

### **Classification Study Process**

K&A conducted a classification study through generally accepted human resources practices and by means of several tools and instruments. We reviewed and analyzed the Position Description Questionnaire (PDQ) submitted to our office and conducted an interview with the Authority employees responsible for oversight of the contract function.

### **Classification Analysis and Findings**

A review of the information supplied by Authority staff enabled us to create a class description for a Recycling Site Inspector. Our assessment of the classification is that the inspection work is performed under close supervision and within clearly prescribed routine and procedures. Direction was requested when encountering unusual or unique situations thereby requiring limited judgment by incumbents in the execution of tasks.

It was our assessment that this work could be performed by an individual who had a high school education and customer service experience. The range of duties and qualifications are captured within Appendix I of this report.

### **Compensation Review**

Stopwaste requested that we conduct a market compensation study, identifying classifications within other public agencies that perform a similar level body of work. We perused the classification system of Bay Area agencies to identify similar classifications. We found that classifications such as meter readers and parking enforcement officers were most similar in that they performed data collection and compliance inspections within prescribed procedures and had similar minimum qualifications. We reviewed classification descriptions to ensure that the descriptions did not include other duties that can be required of meter readers such as repair and maintenance of meters, shut offs, account collections, etc. thereby limiting the scope of work to data collection and reporting. The parking enforcement officers did differ slightly in that they had enforcement duties such as writing tickets, but since judgment was limited to decision such as whether parking meters had expired or that vehicles were parked within appropriate parking spaces, the responsibility level seemed comparable.

The base salary, benefits, and total compensation data can be found in Appendix II of this report. The median market base and total compensation salary findings for the class is listed below.

<b>Classification</b>	<b>Median Monthly Base Salary</b>	<b>Median Monthly Total Compensation</b>
Recycling Site Inspector	\$5,269	\$8,325

Market *base salary median* results show that the proposed hourly wage of the classification would need to be approximately \$30 in order to pay competitively to similar classifications found in other public agencies.

Market *total compensation* results suggest that approximate hourly pay would increase 60% to \$48 if the cost of benefits were factored in.

### **Recommendations**

It is difficult to fully advise without out having detailed costs related to your current service contract but based on our knowledge of the labor market, the public sector pay structure for similarly skilled positions experiences higher compensation costs than the private sector. This analysis only considers compensation and not other program costs that the Authority would have to assume such as risk management, equipment, vehicles, staff management time, etc. There are alternative employment arrangements, such as part time staffing, which could help to curtail costs of benefits.

It was a pleasure conducting this classification and compensation study for Stopwaste. Please do not hesitate to contact us if we can provide any additional information or clarification regarding this summary of our analysis, findings, and recommendations.

## SITE INSPECTOR

### DEFINITION

Under direct supervision, performs site inspection fieldwork of commercial and multifamily accounts to determine and report on compliance with the Alameda County Mandatory Recycling Ordinance (MRO); identifies non-compliance and other irregularities; and performs related work as required.

### SUPERVISION RECEIVED AND EXERCISED

Receives general supervision from an assigned Program Manager. Exercises no supervision of staff.

### CLASS CHARACTERISTICS

This classification performs the full range of duties related to compliance inspection services. Responsibilities require the use of tact and frequent interaction with the public. Positions at this level operate within prescribed instruction and request assistance as new or unusual situations arise. This class is distinguished from the Program Services Specialist classification in that the latter participates in coordinating, implementing, and promoting assigned waste management/resource conservation programs, projects, and initiatives.

### EXAMPLES OF TYPICAL FUNCTIONS (Illustrative Only)

*Management reserves the right to add, modify, change, or rescind the work assignments of different positions and to make reasonable accommodations so that qualified employees can perform the essential functions of the job.*

- Inspects multifamily and commercial accounts based on daily assignments; organizes and schedules routes to ensure timely completion of inspection schedule; gains lawful entry to site locations.
- Observes, photographs, and reports site conditions and provides relevant details related to compliance or suspected non-compliance through a handheld computer tablet; provides thorough documentation of non-compliance or unusual conditions; contacts supervisor if clarification or guidance is needed.
- Attends monthly training activities to promote understanding of ordinance requirements and inspection techniques.
- Drives assigned vehicle and performs safety and service inspections as needed.
- Reads and interprets maps and diagrams in the performance of the work.
- Initiates contact with and represents the District in account interactions; provides account representative with printed reference material and information related to inspection findings; answers account inquiries and refers on questions and issues as needed; refers inquiries to the appropriate resource within or outside the Authority.
- Performs other duties as assigned.

## **QUALIFICATIONS**

### **Knowledge of:**

- Basic operation of computer equipment and applications related to work.
- Safety equipment and practices related to the work, including safe driving rules and practices.
- English usage, spelling, vocabulary, grammar, and punctuation.
- Techniques for providing a high level of customer service by effectively dealing with account representatives, the public, and Authority staff.

### **Ability to:**

- Deal tactfully with the account representatives, the public and others in providing information and answering questions.
- Complete assigned inspections within established guidelines.
- Report data accurately and prepare accurate records.
- Read and interpret street maps.
- Operate a motor vehicle safely.
- Learn and apply applicable Federal, State, and local laws, regulatory codes, ordinances, and procedures relevant to assignment.
- Maintain accurate logs, records, and basic written records of work performed.
- Follow Authority policies and procedures related to assigned duties.
- Understand and follow oral and written instructions.
- Organize own work and meet time deadlines.
- Use English effectively to communicate in person, over the telephone, and in writing.
- Use tact, initiative, prudence and judgment within general policy, procedural, and legal guidelines.
- Establish, maintain, and foster positive and effective working relationships with those contacted in the course of work.

### **Education and Experience:**

*Any combination of training and experience that would provide the required knowledge, skills, and abilities is qualifying. A typical way to obtain the required qualifications would be:*

Equivalent to the completion of the twelfth (12<sup>th</sup>) grade and one (1) year of customer service experience.

### **Licenses and Certifications:**

- Possession of, or ability to obtain, a valid California Driver's License by time of appointment.

## **PHYSICAL DEMANDS**

Must possess mobility to operate a motor vehicle and to work in the field visiting multiple sites; strength, stamina, and mobility to perform light to medium physical work and to operate varied hand tools and equipment such; vision to read printed materials and a computer screen; and hearing and speech to communicate in person and over the telephone. The job involves fieldwork requiring frequent walking in operational areas to identify problems or hazards. Finger dexterity is needed to access, enter, and retrieve data using a computer keyboard or calculator and to operate above-mentioned tools and equipment. Positions in this classification bend, stoop, kneel, reach, and climb to perform work and inspect work

sites. Employees must possess the ability to lift, carry, push, and pull materials and objects weighing up to 10 pounds.

### **ENVIRONMENTAL ELEMENTS**

Employees work in the field and are exposed to loud noise levels, cold and hot temperatures, inclement weather conditions, dust, fumes, and/or allergens, chemicals, and hazardous physical substances and fumes which require the use of protective clothing and equipment such as gloves and vests. Employees may interact with upset staff and/or public and private representatives and contractors in interpreting and enforcing policies and procedures.

**Alameda County Waste Management Authority  
Top Monthly Salary Data  
February 2016**

<b>Inspector</b>						
<b>Rank</b>	<b>Comparator Agency</b>	<b>Class Title</b>	<b>Top Monthly Salary</b>	<b>Effective Date</b>	<b>Next Salary Increase</b>	<b>Next Percentage Increase</b>
1	East Bay Municipal Utility District	Meter Reader	\$5,841	07/01/15	Unknown	Unknown
2	City of San Francisco	Meter Reader	\$5,555	10/10/15	7/1/2016	2.25 - 3.25%
3	City of Hayward	Water Meter Reader	\$5,330	12/15/15	7/1/2016	2.5%
4	City of Berkeley	Parking Enforcement Officer	\$5,207	12/20/15	6/19/2016	1%
5	City of Alameda	Meter Reader	\$5,063	01/11/15	Unknown	Unknown
6	City of Oakland	Parking Control Technician	\$4,498	07/01/15	Unknown	Unknown
7	<b>Alameda County Waste Management Authority</b>	<b>Inspector</b>	<b>Proposed</b>			
<b>Average of Comparators</b>			<b>\$ 5,249</b>			
<b>% Alameda County Waste Management Authority Above/Below</b>			<b>N/A</b>			
<b>Median of Comparators</b>			<b>\$5,269</b>			
<b>% Alameda County Waste Management Authority Above/Below</b>			<b>N/A</b>			
<b>Number of Matches</b>			<b>6</b>			

NOTE: All calculations exclude Alameda County Waste Management Authority

N/C - Non Comparator

1 - The City of Alameda is in the process of labor negotiations; the data pulled is their most current data prior to negotiations.

**Alameda County Waste Management Authority  
Benefit Detail  
February 2016**

Benefit		Alameda County Waste Mgt Authority	City of Alameda	City of Berkeley	City of Hayward	City of Oakland	City of San Francisco	East Bay Municipal Utility District
<b>Class Title</b>			Meter Reader	Parking Enforcement Officer	Water Meter Reader	Parking Control Technician	Meter Reader	Meter Reader
<b>Top Monthly Salary</b>	<b>Proposed</b>	\$5,063	\$5,207	\$5,330	\$4,498	\$5,555	\$5,841	
<b>Employee Retirement</b>								
<b>PERS Formula</b>		2.5%@55	2.7%@55	2.5%@55	2.5%@55	2.1%@61	2.6%@62	
<b>Enhanced Formula Cost</b>		\$251	\$419	\$264	\$223	-\$169	-\$178	
<b>ER Paid Member Contribution</b>		\$95	\$417					
<b>EPMC Reported as Special Comp</b>			\$33					
<b>12 Month Highest Salary</b>		\$68	\$70	\$72				\$79
<b>Social Security</b>						\$344		\$362
<b>Other</b>								
<b>Insurance</b>								
<b>Cafeteria</b>								
<b>Health</b>		\$1,860	\$1,651	\$1,941	\$1,941	\$1,692		\$2,776
<b>Dental</b>		\$133	\$151	\$129	\$113	\$177		\$224
<b>Vision</b>				\$14	\$29			\$24
<b>EAP</b>		\$3	\$2	\$7	\$2			\$5
<b>Life</b>		\$8	\$2	\$5	\$5			\$1
<b>LTD</b>		\$10	\$9			\$22		\$23
<b>STD/SDI</b>								
<b>Other</b>								
<b>Leave</b>								
<b>Vacation</b>		\$302	\$300	\$308	\$260	\$320		\$337
<b>Holidays</b>		\$263	\$320	\$297	\$225	\$342		\$337
<b>Administrative</b>								
<b>Auto Allowance</b>								
<b>Uniform Allowance</b>			\$1,400		\$329			
<b>Deferred Compensation</b>			\$181					
<b>Other</b>								
<b>Longevity</b>								
<b>Benefit Cost</b>		<b>\$2,992</b>	<b>\$4,956</b>	<b>\$3,037</b>	<b>\$3,127</b>	<b>\$2,728</b>	<b>\$3,991</b>	
<b>Total Monthly Comp.</b>	<b>Proposed</b>	<b>\$8,055</b>	<b>\$10,163</b>	<b>\$8,367</b>	<b>\$7,625</b>	<b>\$8,283</b>	<b>\$9,832</b>	

Note: Total Monthly Compensation number may vary slightly from the sum of its components due to cell formulas & rounding.

**Alameda County Waste Management Authority  
Total Monthly Compensation Data  
February 2016**

<b>Inspector</b>						
<b>Rank</b>	<b>Comparator Agency</b>	<b>Class Title</b>	<b>Total Monthly Comp</b>	<b>Effective Date</b>	<b>Next Salary Increase</b>	<b>Next Percentage Increase</b>
1	City of Berkeley	Parking Enforcement Officer	\$10,163	12/20/15	6/19/2016	1%
2	East Bay Municipal Utility District	Meter Reader	\$9,832	07/01/15	Unknown	Unknown
3	City of Hayward	Water Meter Reader	\$8,367	12/15/15	7/1/2016	2.5%
4	City of San Francisco	Meter Reader	\$8,283	10/10/15	7/1/2016	2.25 - 3.25%
5	City of Alameda	Meter Reader	\$8,055	01/11/15	Unknown	Unknown
6	City of Oakland	Parking Control Technician	\$7,625	07/01/15	Unknown	Unknown
7	<b>Alameda County Waste Management Authority</b>	<b>Inspector</b>	<b>Proposed</b>			
<b>Average of Comparators</b>			<b>\$ 8,720</b>			
<b>% Alameda County Waste Management Authority Above/Below</b>			<b>N/A</b>			
<b>Median of Comparators</b>			<b>\$8,325</b>			
<b>% Alameda County Waste Management Authority Above/Below</b>			<b>N/A</b>			
<b>Number of Matches</b>			<b>6</b>			
NOTE: All calculations exclude Alameda County Waste Management Authority						

N/C - Non Comparator