

DRAFT

**MINUTES OF REGULAR MEETING OF THE
PLANNING COMMITTEE
AND
ALAMEDA COUNTY RECYCLING BOARD**

Thursday, December 12, 2019

4:00 P.M.

**StopWaste
1537 Webster Street
Oakland, CA 94612
510-891-6500**

I. CALL TO ORDER

First Vice President Deborah Cox called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m.

II. ROLL CALL OF ATTENDANCE

Jillian Buckholz, Recycling Programs
Bernie Camara, Recycling Materials Processing Industry
Bob Carling, ACWMA
Deborah Cox, ACWMA
Darby Hoover, Environmental Organization
Tianna Nourot, Solid Waste Industry Representative
Jim Oddie, ACWMA
Dave Sadoff, ACWMA
Francisco Zermeño, ACWMA

Absent:

Vacant, Source Reduction Specialist
Vacant, Environmental Educator

Staff Present:

Wendy Sommer, Executive Director
Jeff Becerra, Communications Manager
Meghan Starkey, Senior Management Analyst
Justin Lehrer, Senior Management Analyst
Farand Kan, Deputy County Counsel
Arliss Dunn, Clerk of the Board

III. ANNOUNCEMENTS BY THE PRESIDENT

There were none.

IV. OPEN PUBLIC COMMENT

There was none.

V. CONSENT CALENDAR

- 1. Approval of the Draft Minutes of November 14, 2019 (Jeff Becerra)**
- 2. Board Attendance Record (Jeff Becerra)**

3. Written Report of Ex Parte Communications (Jeff Becerra)

There were no public comments for the consent calendar. Board member Oddie made the motion to approve the consent calendar. Board member Carling seconded and the motion carried 8-0: (Ayes: Buckholz, Camara, Carling, Cox, Hoover, Nourot, Oddie, Sadoff. Nays: None. Abstain: None. Absent: Zermeño, Vacant: Source Reduction Specialist, Environmental Educator)

VI. REGULAR CALENDAR

1. 2020 Meeting Schedule (Arliss Dunn)

It is recommended that the Planning Committee/Recycling Board adopt the regular meeting schedule for 2020.

Clerk Arliss Dunn introduced the item. Board member Carling stated that the October 8, 2020 meeting coincides with the League of Cities Conference and Board member Buckholz stated that the April 22, 2020 joint meeting is on Earth Day. Ms. Dunn recommended that the Board adopt the 2020 meeting schedule and we can discuss the issue at a later date.

There were no public comments on this item. First Vice President Cox made the motion to adopt the 2020 meeting schedule. Board member Sadoff seconded and the motion carried 9-0: (Ayes: Buckholz, Camara, Carling, Cox, Hoover, Nourot, Oddie, Sadoff, Zermeño. Nays: None. Abstain: None. Absent: None. Vacant: Source Reduction Specialist, Environmental Educator)

2. Election of Officers for 2020 (Arliss Dunn)

Elect Officers for 2020.

Clerk Arliss Dunn introduced the item. First Vice President Cox opened the floor for nominations. Board member Oddie motioned to advance the First Vice President (Cox) to serve as President and the Second Vice President (Buckholz) to serve as First Vice President. There were no other nominations. Board member Sadoff seconded and the motion carried 9-0: (Ayes: Buckholz, Camara, Carling, Cox, Hoover, Nourot, Oddie, Sadoff, Zermeño. Nays: None. Abstain: None. Absent: None. Vacant: Source Reduction Specialist, Environmental Educator)

Board member Sadoff nominated Board member Oddie to serve as Second Vice President. There were no other nominations. Board member Zermeño seconded and the motion carried 9-0: (Ayes: Buckholz, Camara, Carling, Cox, Hoover, Nourot, Oddie, Sadoff, Zermeño. Nays: None. Abstain: None. Absent: None. Vacant: Source Reduction Specialist, Environmental Educator)

3. Five Year Financial Audit – Award of Contract (Meri Soll)

That the Recycling Board approve contract award and authorize the Executive Director to enter into a funding agreement with Crowe LLP for the Financial Five Year Audit, for a total not-to-exceed amount of \$188,252.50.

Meri Soll provided an overview do the staff report. A link to the report is available here: [Five-Year-Financial-Audit-Contract.pdf](#).

Board member Sadoff inquired if there were other bids and if so, how did they compare to the selectee. Ms. Soll stated that there were no other bids. Board member Carling inquired as to why were

DRAFT

there no other bids. Ms. Soll stated that it is a niche market. Staff posted the RFP on the website and distributed the RFP to five firms that previously submitted bids and they are more interested in applying for the Five Year Programmatic Audit. There were no public comments on this item. Board member Carling made the motion to approve the staff recommendation. Board member Sadoff seconded and the motion carried 9-0:

(Ayes: Buckholz, Camara, Carling, Cox, Hoover, Nourot, Oddie, Sadoff, Zermeño. Nays: None. Abstain: None. Absent: None. Vacant: Source Reduction Specialist, Environmental Educator)

4. Countywide Element Update: Goals, Objectives and Policies (Wendy Sommer and Meghan Starkey)

Review the proposed goals, objectives, policies and issues listed in the staff report, provide input and give direction to staff.

Wendy Sommer introduced the item and acknowledged staff working on the project: Emily Alvarez, Jeff Becerra, Justin Lehrer, and Meghan Starkey. Ms. Sommer provided a summary of the policy questions that required Board direction and Ms. Starkey provided a summary of the proposed goals and objectives and policy questions and led the Committee through an exercise where they were asked to provide input on the proposed goals and objectives and policy questions. A link to the staff report and a PowerPoint presentation is available here: [ColWMP-Presentation-12-12-19.pdf](#)

Board member Carling inquired with regard to the policy question on agency land if staff would also consider purchasing more land as future reserve. Ms. Sommer stated yes if there are willing sellers. Board member Carling recommended that the policy question should also include the “purchase” of land. Board member Carling asked where we are today with diversion and would it be helpful to have metrics along the way. Ms. Sommer stated that we were at 72% diversion last year and we are currently at 69%. Ms. Starkey added that CalRecycle requires that we report on diversion although they do not use percentages. Although it is not a very scientific number the WMA Board is interested in utilizing percentages. Staff came up with less than 10% good stuff because measuring diversion is challenging. Ms. Sommer added even though the number is not scientific it is easier to understand that we are trying to get to at least 75% diversion. Ultimately our aspirational goal should be “landfill obsolescence”. Ms. Sommer added we will have targets and goals to support the 75% umbrella target, to help us determine if we are doing a good job or whether we need to augment some of our programs, etc. These issues will be addressed as part of annual budgeting process. Board member Carling stated with regard to the question “Do we continue to require the conformance finding process for all facilities within the county,” the response that it is not legally required is not a good reason. Ms. Sommer stated that the lack of the legal requirement is coupled with the other reasons not to do it. Board member Carling recommended that “not legally required” be stricken from the recommendation as it sends a negative message. Board member Oddie stated that he agrees with Board member Carling’s clarification with respect to adding “purchase” to the agency land recommendation. Board member Oddie also stated his agreement for the staff recommendation for keeping the 75% diversion as an aspirational goal. Board member Oddie stated that he agrees with the comments regarding removing the statement “not legally required” with regard to the conformance finding process and inquired if we make the change would we lose any revenue. Ms. Sommer stated no. Board member Hoover inquired with regard to the question of holding on to agency land if it is possible to construct an organics or recycling facility on the land. Ms. Sommer stated that there is a different Measure D policy that governs land use and urban growth boundary that prohibits the construction of a facility unless we are nearing the 15-year capacity mark but is not sure if this refers to a compost facility. County Counsel Farand Kan stated that he would look into the issue. Board

DRAFT

member Hoover stated with regard to the numerical goal if there will be a continuation of multiple specific targets by material types and/or business types. Ms. Sommer stated that right now we are recommending elimination from the plan itself but not from our work plan. Ms. Sommer added, in the future, if we determine that there is a need to reinsert these items we can always amend the plan. Board member Hoover inquired if it is possible to state the numerical goal as a per capita goal. Ms. Starkey stated that CalRecycle now expresses the goal in per capita but we don't want to lean on a flawed system to make policy decisions. Board member Hoover added another potential advantage of using a per capita goal is we can also add a generation goal in the future. Board member Hoover stated another potential advantage for supporting the staff recommendation regarding the conformance finding process is that it would be less onerous for the preferential treatment facilities, i.e. a compost facility will face one less hurdle from being approved and thus increasing organics recycling. Board member Zermeño agrees with the staff recommendations including adding the potential land purchasing aspect. Board member Zermeño inquired if it is possible to emphasize the development of a recycling processing facility on the agency's property. Ms. Sommer stated that legal counsel will need to further explore this. Board member Nourot commented with regard to holding on to agency land if there have been any studies conducted or any approvals granted to allow development of any recycling or composting facilities. Board member Nourot stated that the process takes years. Ms. Sommer stated the agency approach is to evaluate such an endeavor if and when we near the 15-year capacity. President Cox stated her support for Board member Carling's amendment to add "purchase" to the agency land recommendation and Board member Hoover's suggestion to look at per capita for the numerical goal. President Cox inquired with regard to the conformance finding process would we need to add additional staffing if we were required to review the proposed projects at the planning stage. Ms. Sommer stated that if there were a barrage of facilities seeking approval we may be required to add additional staff but we currently have capacity as traditionally there are maybe 1-2 facilities per year.

Board member Carling suggested that the goals are rewritten in such a way that makes it clear that they are goals to be achieved. Ms. Sommer thanked the Board for their input and staff will continue to bring the CoIWMP item to the Committees for input and refinement, with the goal to bring it to the WMA Board in March for the first reading.

VII. COMMUNICATIONS/MEMBER COMMENTS

Board member Buckholz commented that StopWaste is continuing to work with Cal State East Bay on a food waste reduction campaign and they will be distributing a survey to the students in late January 2020. They will also be conducting a waste audit in the dining kitchen and the students are very excited. The Board extended birthday wishes to Ms. Sommer and happy holidays to all. President Cox and Board member Oddie stated that they would be unable to attend the WMA meeting on December 18.

VIII. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 5:20 p.m.